2016/08/23 #critlib chat: Wikipedia & #critlib

Storify of the #critlib chat from 8/23/2016 on Wikipedia & #critlib, moderated by @oksveta, @fiidgit and @nora_almeida. For more information about #critlib, including past & future chats, see http://critlib.org

[Borrowing from @oksveta's disclaimer: I attempted to include all of the relevant tweets from the chat and put them together. Retweets, favorites, & tweets without the hashtag are omitted on purpose. Misreadings and all other mistakes are all my own.]

Readings


Introductions!

S. E. Hackney
@fiidgit

<1hr til #critlib + #Wikipedia, Qs & readings here: critlib.org/wikipedia-crit... & relevant new piece by @bfister here: insidehighered.com/blogs/library-...

Twitter
2 YEARS AGO

S. E. Hackney
@fiidgit

OK, #critlib! Tonight we’re talking about #Wikipedia & LIS! But let’s start with intros: I’m Sarah, an LIS PhD student co-modding w @oksveta

Twitter
2 YEARS AGO

S. E. Hackney
@fiidgit

I’ll have the first 2 Qs, and @oksveta will do the final 3, but you can see them all at critlib.org/wikipedia-crit... #critlib

Twitter
2 YEARS AGO
Gina Shelton
@ginamshelton

Hi! Gina from NY. Academic librarian and Wikipedian. First #critlib chat ever. Thanks for the topic @fiidget :)

2 YEARS AGO

S. E. Hackney
@fiidget

@ginamshelton thanks for helping to get me started on wikipedia!! #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Megan Wacha
@megwacha

Hi, #critlib! I'm Megan, ScholComm ILibrarian at CUNY and board member of @WikimediaNYC

2 YEARS AGO

Megan Wacha
@megwacha

Confession: I set the date and ordered the refreshments for my first edit-a-thon in 2012. THEN I taught myself how to edit. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Megan Wacha
@megwacha

Since then, I've continued to teach editing via edit-a-thons & course assignments and have slowly moved into more of a support role #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

S. E. Hackney
@fiidget

I have heard more than one librarian make this confession! #critlib twitter.com/megwacha/statu...

2 YEARS AGO
Megan Wacha
@megwacha

Confession: I started editing #Wikipedia because I was POed about the gender gap. Now it's fun, humbling, enriching. I found my ppl #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Arlene Haessler
@Rweenie

I learn best by teaching...if I want to learn wiki editing guess I'll be teaching it #critlib
twitter.com/megwacha/status...

2 YEARS AGO

Dianne
@diannelibrarian

Hi #critlib, Dianne, social science R&I librarian. Looking forward!

2 YEARS AGO

sveta
@skveta

Hi #critlib -- it's been awhile! I'm a humanities liaison at the University of Hawai‘i-Mānoa & ur friendly co-mod. twitter.com/fiidget/status...

2 YEARS AGO

Violet Fox
@violetbfox

Hi #critlib, I'm an academic cataloger in the middle of Minnesota. I'm also an occasional Wikipedia editor.

2 YEARS AGO

Kate Crowe
@kcrowe

hey #critlib I'm an academic archivist/curator type person @UofDenver!

2 YEARS AGO
Hi #critlib, I'm a reference librarian at Kapi'o'lan Community College and also an occasional Wikipedia contributor...

2 YEARS AGO

Hi, I'm Gina, library job seeker & freelance proofreader/copy editor participating in tonight's #critlib from Eugene, Oregon. #westcoast

2 YEARS AGO

Hi #critlib. I'm an academic library cataloger in St. Cloud, MN. Very, very occasional Wikipedia editor (maybe five times ever?).

2 YEARS AGO

Hi #critlib, I'm an academic librarian and will be lurking during the night shift.

2 YEARS AGO

#critlib hola, I'm an academic librarian who has helped host a few wikipedia edit-a-thons

2 YEARS AGO

Howdy #critlib! This is my first lurk/chat. Science librarian @ Tufts

2 YEARS AGO

hello #critlib ! I'm a humanities librarian at Queens College, CUNY

2 YEARS AGO
lurkNlearn
@nancyeadams

health sciences librarian who teaches medical students information literacy in the guise of "evidence-based medicine" in Hershey PA #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Marisa Mendez-Brady
@msmendezbrady

Hi #critlib I am an academic librarian, hosting her first ever Wikipedia edit-a-thon this upcoming year! Thanks for the great topic

2 YEARS AGO

Emily Drabinski
@edrabinski

Hi #critlib! Lurking tonight! Only know Wikipedia as a user, excited to learn what ppl are doing as WP builders/makers!

2 YEARS AGO

Jessica Hochman
@jessicahochman

#critlib, late to the party! Faculty at "school of information" and infrequent but enthusiastic Wikipedia!!

2 YEARS AGO

FlaPubLibGuy
@BohVik

I'm a LIS Grad Student at USF & have used WP forever, since it started. I have edited a few articles still a newbie though #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Rory Litwin
@rorylitwin

I'm the founder of @LibJuicePress, just lurking tonight. Looking forward to the next hour. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
Hey #critlib I'm participating from Virginia, library student at USF, new Wikipedia editor, and future library job seeker.

2 YEARS AGO

Academic services and Women and Gender Studies lib in from the U of South Florida, excited to chat a resource I teach with #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Hello #critlib! I do digital lib work at @upennlib & maintain Forward to Libraries service on Wikipedia & elsewhere: en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Wikipedia...

2 YEARS AGO

This is Jenna in NYC, joining #critlib late because I was on a call with folks from the incredible @LISmicroaggess crew. Hi!!

2 YEARS AGO

Hi #critlib, Matthew in Mass - lurking tonight. Medical librarian working with #graphicmedicine and getting hands on training as a fellow.

2 YEARS AGO

Q1. What is your stance towards/relationship with Wikipedia (WP) & what experiences have brought you to that stance?
Violet Fox
@violetbfox

#critlib A1. I’ve had a few discouraging experiences, mostly as a new editor when my corrections were reversed w/o me understanding why.

2 YEARS AGO

Violet Fox
@violetbfox

#critlib A1 (cont) Since then I only contribute to inconsequential articles (it’s no fun to "be bold" when your hard work is erased).

2 YEARS AGO

S. E. Hackney
@fiiidget

@violetbfox did you ever figure out why that was happening? #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Violet Fox
@violetbfox

@fiiidget I’ve gone back and checked, and it really was overzealous editors not being particularly friendly to a new editor. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

S. E. Hackney
@fiiidget

@violetbfox >:-( #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Violet Fox
@violetbfox

#critlib A1 Too many horror stories (like @karencoylen’s recent exp) to be enthusiastic about WP. I find it labyrinthine (& I’m a cataloger!)

2 YEARS AGO
Gina Shelton
@ginamshelton

Q1: Wikipedia great tool for background info on a topic. Want to use my research skills to expand the content. All thanks to #LIS. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

S. E. Hackney
@fiidet

A1: Editor for 2+ years, thx to @megwacha, @silssa & @PrattInfoSchool for making connections btwn LIS & WP for LIS students. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

S. E. Hackney
@fiidet

A1: WP = a p good attempt @ accessible info 4 all. Still built on structural inequalities that prevent true radical openness, tho #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

S. E. Hackney
@fiidet

I've also lead editathons, taught editing workshops & conducted research on the relationship btwn libs & Wikipedia. I'm in! to! it! #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Kate Crowe
@kcrowe

I am most curious about @dbpedia and its possibilities for #dh/#dighum for archives & special collections. #critlib twitter.com/fiidet/status...

2 YEARS AGO

Kate Crowe
@kcrowe

A1: I came to this stance through learning about linked open data for libraries, archives, and museums (#lodlam) #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
S. E. Hackney @fiIDGET
@kcrowe so much awesome #lodlam stuff to do with @dbpedia!! #critlib
2 YEARS AGO

sveta @oksveta
#critlib A1 Cautiously optimistic. Great for info access, great teaching tool, some serious structural issues twitter.com/fiIDGET/statu...
2 YEARS AGO

sveta @oksveta
#critlib I have taught undergrads to edit wikipedia a couple times, participated in a couple of edit-a-thons, & done a few individual edits
2 YEARS AGO

gayatri singh @socaldesi
#critlib A1. I feel like Wikipedia has evolved since the beginning, and I can see how it can be used as a tool for instruction
2 YEARS AGO

gayatri singh @socaldesi
#critlib A1. but being aware of the diversity/inclusion issues I am a little wary. I’ve had both so-so & great interactions w/ editors
2 YEARS AGO

Gina Shelton @ginarnshelton
@socaldesi That’s where I want to go next with WP. Engaging college students in #infolit skills with editing #wikipedia. #critlib
2 YEARS AGO
@ginamshelton Nooo! And it was only done once...How wonderful would it be to carry it forward? Definitely worth exploring! #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Nancy Foasberg
@nfoasberg

A1 I've kind of poked at it & I've read a lot of the documentation, and I've used it in my credit course. Haven't edited much #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Nancy Foasberg
@nfoasberg

A1 part 2: I keep thinking I should edit more, but I don't #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Nicole Nawalaniec
@nawalani

@nfoasberg I agree.. it's a lot of work/effort #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Nancy Foasberg
@nfoasberg

I find it really intriguing as a rare transparent place that knowledge gets put together and presented, and what goes into that #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Dianne
@diannelibrarian

Q1 Use #Wikipedia in IL sessions as place for students to get ideas for research topics, encourage them to look @ citations #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
Kara Plamann Wagoner

A1. I was part of an awesome edit-a-thon where students in HI edited info about their neighborhoods/towns, sparking my Wikilove. #critlib

sveta
@oksveta

Place-based pedagogy! #critlib twitter.com/KaraKaraPW/sta...

ontology mechanic
@cm_harlow

A1 Wikipedia offers a **needing to be evaluated, improved** model for involvement/data mgmt that traditional lib authorities lack #critlib

ontology mechanic
@cm_harlow

A1 cont. So I see Wikipeidia + related projs- DBpedia, Wikidata - as possible ways for community curation/reuse of "authority" data #critlib

ontology mechanic
@cm_harlow

A1 cont but not without social/contextual/technical/data probs needing to be addressed - that maybe libraries can help address best #critlib

ontology mechanic
@cm_harlow

sorry #critlib i just totes jumped on ur hashtag.
Gina Murrell
@GinaMurrell1

A1. In publishing (my 1st career), Wikipedia was viewed as an unreliable reference source. Authors were discouraged from citing it. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

S. E. Hackney
@fiidget

@GinaMurrell1 is the attitude in libraries different in your experience? #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Gina Murrell
@GinaMurrell1

@fiidget At this point, I can't say. I'm still trying to gain a strong foothold in the library field 2 years after earning my MLS. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

sveta
@oksveta

@GinaMurrell1 @fiidget I think there is still a lot of variation in the libraryland Some enthusiasm, lots of apathy? #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Gina Murrell
@GinaMurrell1

@oksveta I'll take your word for it. I'm still finding out! @fiidget #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

S. E. Hackney
@fiidget

@oksveta @GinaMurrell1 it seems like far less outright disdain than 10 years ago, but yeah, still a lot of apathy #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
Nicole Nawalaniec
@nawalani
A1: Huge Wiki fan... Love the idea of crowdsourcing knowledge. 10/10 use daily. Platform for critical thinking #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Eamon Tewell
@EamonTewell
A1: I appreciate Wikipedia's aim to make info free & its participatory structure. Useful for talking abt sources & trust w students #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

S. E. Hackney
@fiiidget
@EamonTewell would love to hear more (from any/all) about WP as teaching tool for infolit! #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Eamon Tewell
@EamonTewell
@fiiidget I usually discuss it w/ other sources--asking what a db vs. google vs. wiki are good for gets lots of interesting answers #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

sveta
@oksveta
@fiiidget @EamonTewell IMO showing the "talk" page of a popular article is a great way to demo knowledge is contested & constructed #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Jessica Hochman
@jessicaehochman
@oksveta @fiiidget @EamonTewell Agree! I love showing it in class, esp contested entries. Transparency like nowhere else! #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
@jessicahochman @oksveta @fiidget students' minds get blown w/ the talk page. I also mention that 90% of editors are men #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

@EamonTewell @oksveta ditto! Luckily, in my last WP class, I had @fiidget present to share some experiences, so helpful. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

@ellicatoric Great idea for demo’ing #infolit Framework with #wikipedia. #critlib twitter.com/oksveta/status...

2 YEARS AGO

@oksveta @fiidget @EamonTewell History, too. It shapes article. 1st edit for menstruation? "Women have this all the fucking time" #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

A1 I say it is OK (but don't go as far as recommd) it as starting place for facts for med students. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Several studies show it isn't necss. incorrect for med info, but incomplete. Ex. drug side fx missing. so... #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
lurknlearn
@nancyeadams

...I encourage med students to use the tools of their profession, and right now Wikip. ain’t it. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Librarian, AFT 7463
@klmccook

#critlib Kathleen McCook have taught class on editing WP to over 150 LIS students last 4 years at U of South FL. School of Information.

2 YEARS AGO

S. E. Hackney
@fiidget

@klmccook thanks for yr fantastic article that’s tonight’s suggested reading!! #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

sveta
@oksveta

@klmccook Your article in Progressive Librarian was our suggested reading. So glad you are also here for the chat #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Nicole Nawalaniec
@nawalani

@klmccook I had the same experience at UofT’s iSchool. Has definitely impacted my views #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Megan Wacha
@megwacha

@nancyeadams Yes! Wikiproject Medicine has much stricter guidelines for adding content, which means a lot gets left out #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
Gina Shelton
@ginamshelton

@nancyeadams How can we get more medical professionals/faculty/students to edit WP? Avg person probably seeks medical info from WP #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

lurknlearn
@nancyeadams

@ginamshelton UCSF med school has for-credit course where they edit WP med articles; thought it was great idea #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Megan Wacha
@megwacha

@ginamshelton @nancyeadams Yes! Wikipedia is number one source for medical info, esp for conditions ppl aren’t comfy asking about #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

lurknlearn
@nancyeadams

agree totally. But for med professionals, I steer them away from WP. It actually IS BRAIN SURGERY #critlib twitter.com/mgwacha/statu...

2 YEARS AGO

Nancy Foasberg
@nfoasberg

@megwacha @ginamshelton @nancyeadams is it anti-Wikipedia bias that I hear that & wish there were a better source for such info? #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Violet Fox
@violetbfox

@nfoasberg @megwacha @ginamshelton @nancyeadams I don’t think so. Maybe medical info shouldn't be crowdsourced--too important. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
Q2. In what ways could Wikipedia be a potential resource or site for enacting #critlib?
sveta
@oksveta

#critlib A2 for pedagogy, get students to see themselves as knowledge producers, demo how knowledge is contested twitter.com/fiidget/statu...

2 YEARS AGO

sveta
@oksveta

#critlib A2.2 especially if their edits don’t stick, great opener for convo about power and knowledge. but need debrief time & fore-thought

2 YEARS AGO

sveta
@oksveta

#critlib A2.3 especially if working w/ student editors, am careful to have them make anonymous accounts to limit their risk of harassment

2 YEARS AGO

Marisa Mendez-Brady
@msmendezbrady

@oksveta thanks for the tip! #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Violet Fox
@violetbf

@jessicaehochman @socaldesi Well, if they’re not, Wikipedia editors often won’t accept them as "legitimate". #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

S. E. Hackney
@fiidget

There are so many places to start on WP (subject areas, notability, infolit) but it can be overwhelming! #critlib twitter.com/fiidget/statu...

2 YEARS AGO
Nicole Nawalaniec
@nawalani

@oksvea @fiidget students should be thinking of themselves as knowledge creators! #critlib

Emily Drabinski
@edrabinski

WP makes contested nature of knowledge visible. Often look here first, then compare to peer review. #critlib twitter.com/fiidget/statu...

Gina Murrell
@GinaMurrell1

A2. Edit-a-thons, like ones for women artists, are great for enacting #critlib principles, i.e. working toward more inclusive histories.

Gayatri Singh
@socaldesi

#critlib A2. with so much focus on citations, when we edit I want us to be more aware of who we are citing; give voice to marginalized...

Gayatri Singh
@socaldesi

#critlib A2. ...scholars. that’s something pulse orlando syllabus made me think abt. it’s more than talking about underrepresented folks...

Gayatri Singh
@socaldesi

#critlib A2. ...it’s important to cite their work.
@socaldesi great point. As much as I love the outside links, they're often to hegemonic, obvious sources. #critlib

S. E. Hackney
@fiidget
Yes! But then there can be problems with what's considered a reliable source, or a notable topic! #critlib twitter.com/socaldesi/stat...

Megan Wacha
@megwacha
+1 Wikipedia reinforces bias in the literature. #critlib twitter.com/socaldesi/stat...

S. E. Hackney
@fiidget
@socaldesi there's some deep deep structural bias in WP bc of who created it, and for all my love, idk if it can be overcome :( #critlib

Eamon Tewell
@EamonTewell
@violetbfox @jessicahochman @socaldesi so interesting how Wikipedia relies on traditional authority & reproduces these structures #critlib

Dianne
@diannelibrarian
A2 Wikipedia seems ripe for #critlib work: empower student voices, work to deconstruct gendered power structure, think critically abt info
Dianne
@diannelibrarian

A2.2...creation & dissemination #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Katherine Ahnberg
Lux_Serviam

Q2. Emerging scholarly language often starts in online discourse communities. Peer review process filters alternative terminology #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Stacy Allison-Cassin
@stacymallison

A2. So many knowledge/political/social structures are visible when editing #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Marisa Mendez-Brady
@msmendezbrady

#critlib A2 I am hoping to teach Wiki editing in the context of narratives not well represented, and to question why they aren't already

2 YEARS AGO

Jenna Freedman
@zinelib

This is SO GOOD. I'm dying from all the great responses to #Wikipedia editing as a site for #critlib. twitter.com/msmendezbrady/...

2 YEARS AGO

Librarian, AFT 7463
@klmccook

Notability big issue.Class often adds entries on libraries & get taken down. Trolls deem subj. not notable. Discouraging. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
Gamaliel @wikigamaliel

@klmcook Unfortunately some editors have a vision of notability that is narrower than WP policy and is influenced by their biases. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Gamaliel @wikigamaliel

@klmcook Outreach needs to be two-way process. Teach new editors about WP, teach WP editors that subjects new to them are notable. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Kelly Swickard @k_swickard

#critlib A2 showing students linked data avail on wp/ citations and citing/ authority control

2 YEARS AGO

lurknlearn @nancyeadams

A2: Juxtapose articles on important underrep. topics at the same time w/ stats showing avg white, male WP editor; amirite? #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Nicole Nawalaniec @nawalani

A2: Scholarship as conversation irl #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Eamon Tewell @EamonTewell

A2: As far as demonstrating the power of non-hierarchical information sources and freely sharing info, Wikipedia is a great example #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
A2. I think WP-conflict, tho frustrating, also useful in showing inherent politics of info & prompting critical eval of assertions. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

A2 Wikipedia is a great place to learn how "collaborative" = unfair influence + powers, oh, + that scholarship isn't a conversation #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

A2 therefore, great place to evidence power imbalances + oppressed voices under banner of "notability" + other "pillars" #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Q3. In what ways are the pillars (i.e. Neutral Point of View) and/or organizational structures of WP in tension with #critlib? bit.ly/2b3HO7d [link to Wikipedia page for the 5 pillars]

2 YEARS AGO

Q3. In what ways are the pillars (i.e. Neutral Point of View) and/or organizational structures of WP in tension with #critlib?

2 YEARS AGO

Only Wikipedia edit from my family so far is gf's addition of a fact about Randy Fenoli as Miss Gay America en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Randy_Fen... #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
S. E. Hackney
@fiigget
@edrabinski v. important work #critlib
2 YEARS AGO

Megan Wacha
@megwacha
Q3: This is a tough question, and I struggle with the word 'tension' as much as I do the word 'neutral' #critlib
2 YEARS AGO

Garnaliel
@wikigarnaliel
@megwacha Unfortunately a structural problem. A way around that is to use librarian powers to find and amplify other sources. #critlib
2 YEARS AGO

Megan Wacha
@megwacha
Yes! For me, this is a call for open access to the lit and recognizing other forms of knowledge creation #critlib twitter.com/wikigarnaliel/s...
2 YEARS AGO

sveta
@oksveta
Very interesting. Can you elaborate a little on that? #critlib twitter.com/megwacha/status...
2 YEARS AGO

Emily Drabinski
@edrabinski
@megwacha What’s the struggle around tension as a word? I use it all the time, didn’t know it was contested! #critlib
2 YEARS AGO
Jessica Hochman
@jessicahochman
@edrabinski @megwacha I'm also curious re: tension. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Megan Wacha
@megwacha
Q3 'Neutral Point of View' is intended as a means to prevent subjective language and a call to "represent the debate" #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Megan Wacha
@megwacha
If we could get at the same thing without using the word neutral, what would we say? I know there's something better. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Nancy Foasberg
@nfoasberg
@megwacha I'm imagining a lot of arguments over which terms are loaded and which ones can safely be used by "all sides" #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

S. E. Hackney
@fiigget
an attempt from WP to prevent editwars, infotrolling, but taken too far? #critlib twitter.com/megwacha/status...

2 YEARS AGO

S. E. Hackney
@fiigget
@megwacha is this a place where "tone policing" would be acceptable? #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
Jessica Hochman
@jessicahochman

@megwacha i don't know if it's possible. All writing has a lens. But to admit that is difficult & dangerous to status quo. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Megan Wacha
@megwacha

@jessicahochman YES. Most Wikipedians recognize you can't be neutral. It's more about writing style, representing the debate. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Violet Fox
@violetbfox

@megwacha @jessicahochman Do you think many WP editors wouldn't defend (their idea of) "rational" POV being superior to others? #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Megan Wacha
@megwacha

@violetbfox @jessicahochman It depends. Are we talking about the majority of editors, or the loudest voices? #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Garnaliel
@wikigarnaliel

@violetbfox @megwacha @jessicahochman I would be surprised if a majority of WP editors didn't feel this way. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Jessica Hochman
@jessicahochman

@violetbfox @megwacha imo all people defend their ideas as "right"; prob is that most people don't acknowledge they have a lens #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
**Violet Fox**
@violetbfox

@megwacha @jessicahochman I’m sure you interact with lots of reasonable editors, but hard to hear them over louder GG-esque voices. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

**Tina Gross**
@aboutness

@violetbfox @megwacha @jessicahochman From what I’ve seen, they have no critical distance from their notions of neutral, rational. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

**Megan Wacha**
@megwacha

@violetbfox @jessicahochman I know. And it depends on where you edit, what you contribute. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

**Alex Stinson**
@sadads

@violetbfox @jessicahochman as @megwacha points out: only certain topics attract the trolling editors: most editing uncontroversal #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

**Jessica Hochman**
@jessicahochman

@aboutness @violetbfox @megwacha super interesting & kinda sad. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

**S. E. Hackney**
@fiitudget

A3: I think we've already started talking about the problems w who "gets to be notable" creating barriers for representation #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
sveta
@oksveta

How do you think this structural bias compares with similar in "traditional" reference sources?
#critlib twitter.com/fiigiet/status...

2 YEARS AGO

S. E. Hackney
@fiigiet

@oksveta on WP it is more visible, more accessible and hopefully more malleable. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Emily Drabinski
@edrabinski

Def seems to adhere to pretty conservative ideas about what counts as proof/evidence. #critlib
twitter.com/oksveta/status...

2 YEARS AGO

gayatri singh
@socaldesi

@oksveta yaasss! just b/c info moves online doesn't make it perfect/imperfect. these issues exist w/ our print collections at well #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Emily Drabinski
@edrabinski

@socaldesi Totally agree! Maybe a way to talk about how format doesn't determine much?
@oksveta #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Gina Murrell
@GinaMurrell1

A3. Wikipedia is touted as a neutral resource, but librarians (& libraries) aren't neutral. We bring biases when using/editing it. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
Nancy Foasberg  
@nfoasberg

A3: Notability has always seemed kind of weird and potentially power-reinforcing. What's notable and what isn't? #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Stacy Allison-Cassin  
@stacymallison

A3 the "rule" against primary sources can be hugely problematic. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Kate Crowe  
@kcrowe

Srsly. What if somet's oral history abt their own life contradicts a published "authoritative" src abt it? #critlib twitter.com/stacymallison/...

2 YEARS AGO

Kate Crowe  
@kcrowe

I am by no means saying that human memory is infallible. Clearly it's not. But it's THEIR LIFE. THEIR STORY. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Marisa Mendez-Brady  
@msmendezbrady

@stacymallison great insight! And extremely subjective, and therefore potentially oppressive #critlib #wikipedia twitter.com/stacymallison/...

2 YEARS AGO

Violet Fox  
@violetbfox

A3. WP says "personal experiences, interpretations, or opinions don't belong," which is anathemic to #critlib. They inform our worldview.

2 YEARS AGO
@violetbfox seems impossible to write anything without interpretations. #critlib

A3: I get annoyed with the idea of "authoritative sources" in Wikipedia...how can that be explored/part of dialogue through a #critlib lens?

A3: The encyclopedia/tertiary pillar can be tricky to navigate with a professor, as @megwacha & I learned working with a class. #critlib

There is no "neutral point of view," first of all. And "notability," which others have mentioned. #critlib twitter.com/oksveta/status...

A3: As #critlib, we need to take a stance & not be neutral. But also, Wiki is an encyclopedia so neutrality is sort of their thing

@nawalani @ginamshelton @oksveta a good editathon is an empowering safe space-- makes no bones abt BS on WP, encourages nonetheless #critlib
Katherine Ahnberg
LuxServiam

A3. False sense of neutrality and equity #critlib

Tina Gross
@aboutness

A3: In practice, "neutral" really means in line with dominant/mainstream/most broadly accepted views, no? #critlib

Violet Fox
@violietfbox

Yup. #critlib twitter.com/aboutness/stat...

Violet Fox
@violietfbox

The "consensus" touted by WP seems diff than #critlib version of consensus--WP editors can bully/"lawyer" vs. ideal of inclusivity. #critlib

Ray Maxwell @HSFINHPLOD · 2 YEARS AGO

Sorry, late to #critlib. @KaraKaraPW's tweet on authority caught my eye. Mapping the ACRL Framework has helped me. pic.twitter.com/593yqVQf2T

sveta
@oksveta

I wonder if WP rule on "no primary sources" is part of claim to legitimacy. Might this change as WP becomes more widely embraced? #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
@oksveta This policy & WP:V came into real effect c. '05/'06 as a response to criticism about quality: youtube.com/watch?v=yChkep... #critlib

ALEX STINSON @SADADS - 2 YEARS AGO

Gina Shelton
@ginamshelton

A3 Need to be aware of bias but difficult to avoid. Need for more ppl w/ different backgrounds to edit and balance each other out. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Gina Shelton
@ginamshelton

A3 Kind of an accountability system where multiple voices can hopefully balance out the bias #critlib twitter.com/ginamshelton/s...

2 YEARS AGO

Gamaliel
@wikigamaliel

NPOV necessary and powerful tool to keep WP from being hijacked by agendas, but also serves to reinforce cultural hegemony. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
@oksveta Primary sources are widely abused to push agendas and create personal interpretations, don’t foresee this rule changing. #critlib

@JMarkOckerbloom

A3. In some ways I find spirit of Ranganathan more useful for describing the best ideas behind "NPOV" than the "neutral" concept. #critlib

@JMarkOckerbloom

("Every reader their articles"; "Every article its readers [w all POVs readers might be interested in]"; "WP’s a growing organism" #critlib)

@allanaaaaaaa

A3 I've brought up WP in discussion of other "neutral" user-content platforms inevitably going dumpsterfire #critlib twitter.com/allanaaaaaaa/s...

@allanaaaaaaa

A3 ... that said, Wikipedia's seniority-based "consensus" models has a lot in common with how libraries work these days ... #critlib

@sadads

@allanaaaaaaa less seniority and more who can appeal to the shared community values best (which usually comes with experience) #critlib 1/2
Q4. Do librarians have a responsibility to address pitfalls of WP like gender/race/identity gaps?

sveta
@oksveeta
Q4. Do librarians have a responsibility to address pitfalls of WP like gender/race/identity gaps? #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Violet Fox
@violetbfox
#critlib A4 Not unless I’m getting paid for it.

2 YEARS AGO

sveta
@oksveeta
#critlib Great reminder of another structural issue with WP: So much unpaid digital labor! twitter.com/violetbfox/sta...

2 YEARS AGO

Alex Stinson
@sadads
@oksveeta The problem is that most human good projects are contingent on goodwill, and only work when supported by idealists #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

lurklearn
@nancyeadams
@sadads @oksveeta Tragedy of the commons? #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
Alex Stinson
@sadads
@nancyeadams @oksveta Yep, and squatting by the early pioneers with lots of access to that commons. But takes a village to change #critlib
2 YEARS AGO

Jenna Freedman
@zinellib
A4: Addressing pitfalls of WP like gender/race/identity gaps eems like basic #infolit to me, or what info lit should be! #critlib #ifonly
2 YEARS AGO

Jessica Hochman
@jessicahochman
@zinellib exactly! #critlib
2 YEARS AGO

Jenna Freedman
@zinellib
A4 In add'n to addressing representation in Wikipedia, it's great if you have a librarian who is a #WikiWarrior like @megwacha. :) #critlib
2 YEARS AGO

Alex Stinson
@sadads
@zinellib For the most part Wikipedians are receptive to change, and acknowledge the gaps: behavior change that is hard part #critlib.
2 YEARS AGO

Gayatri Singh
@socaldesi
@sadads @zinellib I love the idea/mission of WP. does practice need to improve? yes. which is why these conversations are important #critlib
2 YEARS AGO
Alex Stinson @sadads
@socaldes @zinelib Indeed: but once you have the convs outside the community, needs to be paired w/ long hard action from within #critlib
2 YEARS AGO

Nancy Foasberg @nfoasberg
A4 I don't know if I'd call it a responsibility, I'm not here to assign homework to the field of librarianship #critlib
2 YEARS AGO

Nancy Foasberg @nfoasberg
A4 but I think it's a good thing to do! #critlib
2 YEARS AGO

Dianne @diannelibrarian
A4 Libs can't(shouldn't) ignore Wikipedia. Feel like if you are using/mentioning to your users, should be transparent abt issues #critlib
2 YEARS AGO

Violet Fox @violetbfox
#critlib A4. It isn't underrepresented people's job to save Wikipedia from itself.
2 YEARS AGO

Tina Gross @aboutness
A4: Broadly, YES. In Wikipedia specifically? Proby not. A laudable goal, but I don't think that resource is our "responsibility." #critlib
2 YEARS AGO
A4. If we're using it to teach, yes; great intro to critical analysis #critlib

2 YRS AGO

lurknbearn
@nancyeadams

A4 IMHO not necessarily librarian's responsibility to do it, but definitely to empower others to correct for their own self. #critlib

2 YRS AGO

lurknbearn
@nancyeadams

A4 reminds me of story: angry patron, holding book, "did u c what this book says? why aren't you telling ppl about it??" #critlib

2 YRS AGO

Gina Murrell
@GinaMurrell1

A4 As believers in democratization of information, librarians must ensure the info meets the needs of all. Use/edit WP accordingly. #critlib

2 YRS AGO

Allana Mayrer
@allanaaaaaaa

A4 not sure what "address" means here - do you mean telling patrons about its weaknesses and pitfalls? #critlib

2 YRS AGO

Allana Mayrer
@allanaaaaaaa

A4 ... because you could make an argument for Wikipedia-editing as "volunteer"/"scholarly" work for academic librarians #critlib

2 YRS AGO
Allana Mayer
@allanaaaaaaa

A4 but asking other heritage workers, who don’t have allotted time in their paid hours, to contribute is cruel, don’tcha think? #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Stacy Allison-Cassin
@stacymallison

A4 depends on context. Infolit yes, using it to feed a digital project or promote content, yes. Edit-a-thon, yes. But mandate? #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Gamaliel
@wikigamaliel

A4: WP is world’s largest info source. Our patrons are all there. If we aren’t, are we fulfilling our duties as info professionals? #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Kate Crowe
@kcrowe

I have many feelings about this and am now determined to find cited published prim src in Wikipedia. #critlib twitter.com/wikigamaliel/s...

2 YEARS AGO

S. E. Hackney
@fiidget

A4: In no way should be an obligation to edit, but libs shld be aware of how WP works, and honest abt it w patrons/students/peers #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

S. E. Hackney
@fiidget

A4: Libs & librarians need to make their voices heard re:Wikipedia, lest the public (or Wiki admin) think we don’t care. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
#critlib A4. I think WP is intentionally seeking out partnerships with libraries, and in that role we should definitely be talking abt it

@socaldesi

2 YEARS AGO

Sure, if they pay me #critlib twitter.com/socaldesi/stat...

@allanaaaaaaa

2 YEARS AGO

A4 it'd be nice to have automated bots set up for librarians just to flag, revert, delete bad articles. minimal time, maximal gain. #critlib

@allanaaaaaaa

2 YEARS AGO

A4 As long as WP (or Google for that matter) is so widely used, librarians have responsibility to understand its structural issues #critlib

@oksveta

2 YEARS AGO

#critlib A4.2 and to intervene to the extent that their position allows; not an "off-the-clock" moral responsibility to edit

@oksveta

2 YEARS AGO

#critlib @oksveta So maybe we should ask -- should libraries be supporting librarians' work to address pitfalls of Wikipedia? (yes)

@nfoasberg

2 YEARS AGO
Kara Plamann Wagoner
A4: I like to edit because I'm prone to more talk than action...wp= a comfortable place to being gaining #critlib confidence & close gaps

John Mark Ockerbloom
A4. IMO, as long as users use WP, we have responsibility to help use it well (eg by making them aware of gaps and/or helping fix) #critlib

John Mark Ockerbloom
A4. By "we" I mean librns of all sorts; burden shouldn't default to those most hurt by gaps. Tho I hope I'm told when I do it wrong. #critlib

Megan Wacha
+1 Librarians should be supported to work with Wikipedia, but not required. Personal, informed choices #critlib twitter.com/JMarkOckerbloom...

P. F. Anderson
@pfanderson
@JMarkOckerbloom Also to help shape appropriate use - mine bibliography for resources, dig back to original sources, etc. #CritLib

Librarian, AFT 7463
Work to include WP work in P & T or annual review. #critlib twitter.com/megwacha/status...
Q5. What accounts for historic maligning of WP by libs and what does this tell us about our own stance towards information?

sveta
@oksveta
Q5. What accounts for historic maligning of WP by libs and what does this tell us about our own stance towards information? #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

FlaPubLibGuy
@BohVik
A5 Reason for historic bad rep of WP is printed Encyclopedias, with printed citations. must be right. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Jenna Freedman
@zinelib
A5: I feel like librarians were early to using Wikipedia critically, though not as open as now. Convincing profs is a challenge. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
Eamon Tewell
@EamonTewell

@zinelib most resistance I see re: wikipedia use is from profs (and usually in the middle of instruction sessions) #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Allana Moyer
@allanaaaaaa

A5 fully justified intuition-based suspicions borne out by later evidence #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Garmaliel
@wikigarmaliel

A5. Mission to promote quality sources of info, so a natural reaction to an untested source. Now librarians are excited about WP. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Katherine Ahnberg
Lux_Serviam

A5 General mistrust of crowdsourced materials, "armchair" academics, any anonymity in relation to authority #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Katherine Ahnberg
Lux_Serviam

A5. Who gets to be the expert? #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Dianne
@diannelibrarian

A5 Wiki represents move away from trad scholarly sources to open, free & crowdsourced. Scary for ppl who built careers on print #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
A5 Fear of becoming obsolete? Fear of info free-for-all? Fear of disrupting white cishet control of mainstream access to info? Fear #critlib

@fiidget except if there's white cishet control of wikipedia (is there?) seems like little difference? #critlib

@fiidget right, time has proven. but 15 years ago, it cld have been anything (not really, it cld have only ever been this way) #critlib

@fiidget It's like we're all rearranging deck chairs til the revolution comes. #critlib

@fiidget Yep. WP model of "everyone as info source" disrupts narrative that's historically been white cishet Christian normative. #critlib

@fiidget Agree + jealously over gatekeeping knowledge. Begs Lacanian question: Why do we need jealously to maintain our identity? #critlib
Injecting this oldie but a goodie into tonight’s #critlib chat on Wikipedia. twitter.com/ingredient_x/s...

Another oldie-but-goodie tweet, prompted by Q5. #critlib twitter.com/barnlib/status...

@barnlib this is amazing! Thank you for the epic belly laughs #critlib

A5: WP was free, accessible to all, unmediated by us. Librarians’ turf was threatened. #critlib twitter.com/oksveta/status...

A5 I became a Wikipedian for the same reasons I became a librarian. Information access. Taking down the patriarchy. #critlib

@megwacha yaaassss! #critlib
A5. I think a lot of this distrust comes from reluctance to acknowledge expertise in people w/o institutional recognition #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

@nfoasberg so true. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

A5: Reliance on traditional modes of authority (print, scholarly) is easy. Understanding new means of producing information is hard #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

#critlib A5. I think argument that librarians/college profs are afraid of WP or don't trust it is primarily a straw man at this point.

2 YEARS AGO

Whoops, forgot #critlib twitter.com/diannelibrarian...

2 YEARS AGO

A5. Historically, libs were gatekeepers of information. WP model of everyone as a knowledge source resulted in it being maligned. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
Matthew Noe
@NoetheMatt

#Librarianship has a pathological fear of becoming irrelevant. Makes us make bad decisions. #critlib twitter.com/GinaMurrell1/s...

Emily Drabinski
@edrabinski

Other faculty worse on this. "No WP" all over syllabus/assignments, hasn’t come from my mouth in yrs. #critlib twitter.com/oksjeta/status...

Megan Wacha
@megwacha

A5 If you want to change the wikibrarian convo, join the listserv! It's pretty quiet, but we can fix that #critlib lists.wikimedia.org/mailman/listin...

Gamaliel
@wikigamaliel

@megwacha I can't believe I haven't been calling myself a wikibrarian already. Changing that now. #critlib

Nicole Nawalaniec
@nawalani

A5: Love all of the answers to this question! Changing notion of what is "real evidence", not what is scholarly or traditional #critlib

Ray Maxwell
hsfihphdldf

I have collided with "notability" issues in trying to break in to WP. Same old walls, y'all hear?. #critlib
A5: Authority, authority, authority...of librarians to collect/select, of info publishers to select what's worthy. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

John Mark Ockerbloom
@JMarkOckerbloom

I'm wondering if #critlib Q5 a bit slanted. "Malign" implies unwarranted criticism, but we've seen plenty of basis for criticism in-chat.

2 YEARS AGO

sveta
@oksveta

#critlib Good point! Distrust perhaps would have been a better term.
twitter.com/JMarkOckerbloo...

2 YEARS AGO

Pitches

sveta
@oksveta

What a wonderful #critlib chat! Last 5 min... time for #critpitch

2 YEARS AGO

sveta
@oksveta

if you are new, #critpitch = share announcements, resources, CFPs, etc relevant to chat or #critlib at large twitter.com/oksveta/status...

2 YEARS AGO

Librarian, AFT 7463
@klmccook

Dr. Carla Hayden nominated & confirmed as LoFC. Her entry barely updated. Librarians should enhance that WP article. LOTS OF US! #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
S. E. Hackney  
@fiidget

Yes! We are hoping to plan some #critlib editathons for those interested after the chat ends! #critlib twitter.com/klmccook/statu...

Jessica Hochman  
@jessicahochman

@fiidget fantastic! My Identity course is doing one with @megwacha later this term! #critlib

Kate Crowe  
@kcrowe

#critpitch +1 #critlib twitter.com/klmccook/statu...

Allana Mayer  
@allanaaaaaa

#CRITPITCH yaaaaaas: the month of September, read the @lisjournalclub article + talk about it with us on #lisjc! #critlib

Allana Mayer  
@allanaaaaaa

#critlib #critpitch here it is! twitter.com/lisjournalclub...

Emily Drabinski  
@edrabinski

Looks fantastic! Love @davehudson123’s work. Smart. Challenging. #critlib twitter.com/lisjournalclub...

LibraryJuice Academy  
@LibJuiceAcademy

We hope @megwacha will teach her Wikipedia class for us again! #critpitch #critlib
**Violet Fox**  
@violetbfox

#critpitch: Next #critlib chat is available if anyone wants to volunteer to moderate a chat on Tues. Sept. 6th! [critlib.org/twitter-chats/...](https://critlib.org/twitter-chats/...)

2 YEARS AGO

---

**Emily Drabinski**  
@edrabinski

Thx so much @oksveta @megwacha @fiidget for a great #critlib tonight!

2 YEARS AGO

---

**Jenna Freedman**  
@zinelib

#critlib pitch: who's going to Storify this epic chat?

2 YEARS AGO

---

**Megan Wacha**  
@megwacha

Thank you to @oksveta and @fiidget for a fantastic conversation tonight! #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

---

**Alex Stinson**  
@sadads

Ditto, important conversations about the comm! But needs to be paired with exp: 1libr.org  
#critlib twitter.com/megwacha/statu...

2 YEARS AGO

---

**S. E. Hackney**  
@fiidget

Want to do some #critlib editing? Watch this space, and reach out to me, @sveta and/or @nora_almeida to help organize something(s)!!

2 YEARS AGO
Tina Gross @aboutness
#critlib #critpitch For those who haven’t seen it--please check out the SAC report on the LCSH "Illegal aliens" twitter.com/aboutness/stat...
2 YEARS AGO

John Mark Ockerbloom @JMarkOckerbloom
1 thing I think WP underrated on: rapid response to new events & interests. (In contrast, *still* no "Black Lives Matter" LCSH/NA.) #critlib
2 YEARS AGO

Kelly Swickard @k_swickard
#critlib I think this is important point that trad LC info is way behind current issues twitter.com/JMarkOckerbloo...
2 YEARS AGO

Violet Fox @violetbfox
@JMarkOckerbloom Not true. Black Lives Matter Movement #LCSH is approved as of August 2016. Not sure of timeline, but it’s coming. #critlib
2 YEARS AGO

Emily Drabinski @edrabinski
Just asked gf, "Do I have anything for the #critlib #critpitch?" "I do not know what that means." So, I guess that means no!
2 YEARS AGO

Jessica Hochman @jessicahochman
YES! Thanks @fiidget & @oksveta! This was so great! #critlib
2 YEARS AGO
Megan Wacha
@megwacha

I cannot recommend this enough -- CFP: WikiConference North America
wikiconference.org/wiki/2016/Main... #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Marisa Mendez-Brady
@msmendezbrady

Thanks @megwacha! And thanks everyone for an inspiring #critlib chat. Y'all are amazing librarians. twitter.com/megwacha/statu...

2 YEARS AGO

Dianne
@diannelibrarian

Another great #critlib chat! So grateful for this little corner of the internet: always learning & challenging status quo. Keeps me engaged

2 YEARS AGO

S. E. Hackney
@fiidget

Thanks everyone for a great discussion!! And thanks to @oksveta for co-modding, and the absent @nora_almeida for helping to plan #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

lurknlearn
@nancyeadams

Thanks, mods and tweeters! #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Kelly Swickard
@k_swickard

#critlib think for faculty being agst wp it is bec students literally copy&paste from wp/ they think it is free text to use without citing

2 YEARS AGO
Nancy Foasberg
@nfoasberg

I've been out of #critlib for a while, & this was a great convo to come back in on! Thanks @megwacha @oksveta @fiidget!

2 YEARS AGO

Arlene Haessler
@Rweenie

Thanks all this was so informative and fun!!! #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Kelly Swickard
@k_swickard

#critlib thanks all very interesting and engaging conversation

2 YEARS AGO

sveta
@oksveta

Thanks @fiidget & @nora_almeida for being fantastic co-mods! & Thanks #critlib for a great chat... I have missed participating in these!

2 YEARS AGO

John Mark Ockerbloom
@JMarkOckerbloom

Thank you to the organizers & everyone who participated in tonight's #critlib chat! Great to hear so many voices.

2 YEARS AGO