#critlib 2016-07-26: "offensive" items

Archive of the July 26, 2016 #critlib chat on "offensive" items in the collection, moderated by @zoh_zoh. For more info about #critlib, including past and future chats, visit critlib dot org.

---

**Zoe Fisher**
@zoh_zoh

for those following #critlib chats, I am excited to moderate Tuesday's chat at 6pm Pacific  
critlib.org/twitter-chats/...

---

**Zoe Fisher**
@zoh_zoh

helpful background reading for Tuesday's #critlib chat: "A Library's Approach to Books That Offend"  
cityroom.blogs.nytimes.com/2009/08/19/a-l...

---

**Zoe Fisher**
@zoh_zoh

another helpful reading for Tuesday's #critlib chat: "Diversity in Collection Development"  
ala.org/advocacy/intfr...

---

**Zoe Fisher**
@zoh_zoh

& this might be behind a paywall for you, but I highly recommend anything by Emily Knox for Tuesday's #critlib chat  
muse.jhu.edu/article/552025

---

**Kevin Seeber**
@kevinseeber

Feel free to DM me if you need a copy, #critlib. twitter.com/zoh_zoh/status...
Jenna Freedman
@zinelib

Tomorrow at 9pm ET #critlib on “offensive” items in the collection, moderated by @zoh_zoh.
Questions & readings: critlib.org/offensive-item...

wpwvcacrl
@wpwvcacrl

How do we deal with "offensive" materials, censorship, & user involvement in #collectiondevelopment? #critlib twitter.com/zinelib/status...

Nora Almeida
@nora_almeida

#critlib confession in adv of "offensive" items chat: I weeded some 90's Trump / real estate propagandaesq titles this yr #theywereoutofdate

Jamie Howe
@Gaymerbrarian

Tonight's #critlib will be interesting bc a) I'm actually here for it & b) I've actually just finished uncensoring a collection at work

Introductions

Zoe Fisher
@zoh_zoh

good evening & welcome to #critlib. let's start with introductions! if you're just joining us, readings etc here: critlib.org/offensive-item...

Zoe Fisher
@zoh_zoh

my name is Zoe (Zoh-ee), I'm the new Pedagogy & Assessment Librarian at Auraria Library in Denver (1 library serving 3 schools) #critlib
Zoe Fisher
@zoh_zoh

full disclosure: I work with @kevinseeber and it's pretty rad #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Zoe Fisher
@zoh_zoh

a brief intro to the topic before we begin w/ Q&A: the concept of "offensive" intrigues me bc it is wrapped up in culture & power #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Zoe Fisher
@zoh_zoh

in tonight's discussion I encourage us to openly question & engage with the cultural norms that characterize 'offensive' items... #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Zoe Fisher
@zoh_zoh

...and I also want us to consider our professional responsibilities as librarians to fight censorship (and our own urge to censor) #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

lurkilearn
@nancyeadams

Nancy here in Harrisburg, PA #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Kate Deibel
@metageeky

Hi #critlib. I'm Kate, a lib tech dev disciplinary weirdo from UW in Seattle.

2 YEARS AGO

Kate Deibel
@metageeky

And #critlib, be sure to be as nice to @zoh_zoh as you were when I was moderating last week

2 YEARS AGO
Jenna Freedman
@zinelib

Hi @zoh_zoh & other #critlib-ers! I'm Jenna, tweeting from NYC, where I work at @barnlib as outreach, zine, & WGSS librarian.

2 YEARS AGO

Jenna Freedman
@zinelib

I hope some #critlib lurkers will feel empowered to de-lurk tonight. Do what you feel comfortable with, but know your voice is valued.

2 YEARS AGO

Jamie Howe
@Gaymerbrarian

@zinelib this particular discussion will benefit from pub libs etc b/c much censorship attention on them & many response strategies #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Kevin Seeber
@kevinseeber

Want to echo @zinelib on this. Please say "hi!" or a whole lot more! Whatever's cool with you. #critlib twitter.com/zbekin/status...

2 YEARS AGO

Tina
@aboutness

Hi all. Tina, academic library cataloger in St. Cloud (perhaps not as dreamy as it sounds), Minnesota. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Lisa Hubbell
@lisahubbell

Hi #critlib academic librarian in California.

2 YEARS AGO
Hi #critlib! Kevin here. Academic library instruction person from Denver, where @zoh_zoh and I talk around the water cooler together.

2 YEARS AGO

hiya #critlib recent rutgers grad / current job searcher in NJ v v gay v v offensive

2 YEARS AGO

Jessica, librarian at a public uni in Minnesota #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Hi #critlib, I’m a cataloger and subject spec who works with a lot of controversial stuff in MI.

2 YEARS AGO

I’m Montserrat Biedermann. I live on the Internet. I should be writing an article, but I’m lurking on #critlib because of the topic.

2 YEARS AGO

Hey people in tonight’s #critlib, both typing & lurking! I’m Ryan, instruction & outreach librarian at a community college in Boise, Idaho.

2 YEARS AGO
Hi #critlib, I’m an academic library director at a public college in NYC, glad I remembered this week!

2 YEARS AGO

Hi #critlib Ellen, Special collections librarian, John Jay College of Criminal Justice/CUNY

2 YEARS AGO

Hi, #critlib! Systems/metadata librarian in NYC. I wanna toss something into the ring about "offensive": finenessandaccuracy.wordpress.com/2010/01/13/i-d...

2 YEARS AGO

Oh all of this. #critlib twitter.com/rowmyboat/stat...

2 YEARS AGO

Hi #critlib - Lisa, infolit coord at R1 in Illinois. Confessing up front ... also watching the #DemsInPhilly

2 YEARS AGO

Lurking around #critlib a bit (Hi, I'm Rachel, academic medical library director)

2 YEARS AGO

Wait, another #critlib this week?! Ian here, lurking from the A train again...

2 YEARS AGO
Q1. What kinds of materials in your library have offended your users?

Zoe Fisher  
@zoh_zoh

Q1. What kinds of materials have offended your users? #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Zoe Fisher  
@zoh_zoh

A1. a recently example: last qtr a student at my community college found a book called THE RED MAN during a lib instruction session #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Zoe Fisher  
@zoh_zoh

A1. he told the librarian (not me) that he was offended by the title of the book and didn't think we should keep it #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Jamie Howe  
@Gaymerbrarian

@zoh_zoh this is interesting: offensive historical materials can have academic value to scholars = "different" type of offensive? #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Kate Deibel  
@metageeky

A1: Before my time in this job, but I know some students have objected to journal titles that use euphemisms from the past #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Kate Deibel  
@metageeky

A1: Example, the Journal of Exceptional Children #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
Jenna Freedman
@zinelib

@metageeky That’s real. I think it’s more likely at my institution to get that kind of challenge than one based on explicit content.

2 YEARS AGO

Kate Deibel
@metageeky

@zinelib The journal I mentioned was an issue for a student disability advocacy group I was a part of at the time. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Kate Deibel
@metageeky

@zinelib My argument against the complaint was where would the banning end? Some still went forward, but the journals remain. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Jessica Schomberg
@schomj

A2 Vampire romances, that we don’t have maps of hell (or heaven, I forget which) #critlib twitter.com/zoh_zoh/status...

2 YEARS AGO

Jessica Schomberg
@schomj

A1 I’ve been offended at the presence of gratuitous racism in a book about perfume (and weeded + replaced it; yes I am that person) #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Dr.EB
@LNBel

A1: I had to remove an item from an exhibit because higher up said it featured a ‘cop killer’ #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
Kevin Seeber  
@kevinseeber  
A1: Never had materials challenged at one of my libraries?! Instead, had users protest *removal* of materials. #weedingsucks #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Zoe Fisher  
@zoh_zoh  
@schomj A1. the next question is about what you/your staff have found offensive ;) good example! #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Jessica Schomberg  
@schomj  
A1 Are we talking about shelving choices too? Because our Af-Am history is shelved at the back and Af-Am students were offended #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Zoe Fisher  
@zoh_zoh  
@schomj that's question 3! you're on fire! :D #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

rowmyb[like]  
@rowmyboat  
A1 ....because without our context as an institution, there’s A LOT of really offensive/harmful stuff in the building. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Zoe Fisher  
@zoh_zoh  
A1. another example: student was offended that we shelved Bible in BS, per Library of Congress. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
@zoh_zoh Yeah, that's the #LOCLOL that happened whenever I trained new shelvers at a former job. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Rachael Neu
@RachaelNeu

Oh, hey there #critlib! I'm an academic ref/instr libn & slightly distracted by the #DNCinPHL + a late dinner

2 YEARS AGO

MARCinaColdClimate
@marccold

A1. P of the E of Z. We have a special collection focusing on history of anti-Semitism. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

lurknlearn
@nancyeadams

@Gaymerbrarian absolutely, I like to read such materials like a sociologist would, only prob is when people see me with the title...#critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Tina
@aboutness

A1 We have had vandalism (right word?) of LGBT-related books, but no challenges or complaints. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

MARCinaColdClimate
@marccold

A1 (cont) And so we have a lot of primary source texts, inc that one. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
Ryan P. Randall
@foureyedsoul

A1 At the library where I did undergrad, a prof kept a lot of the art history books (with nudes) checked out so wouldn't circulate #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Ryan P. Randall
@foureyedsoul

A1.1 Which isn't "removal from collection" in the strictest sense, but definitely removed from accessible circulating collection #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Jenna Freedman
@zinelib

Another example of censorship direct action, which is kinda fascist. twitter.com/foureyedsoul/s...

2 YEARS AGO

Ryan P. Randall
@foureyedsoul

Plus, if I recall correctly, it was a non-humanities scholar imposing *~his~* "community" standards #critlib twitter.com/zinelib/status...

2 YEARS AGO

Lisa Hubbell
@lisahubbell

A1. My museum had a work by Andres Serrano when Jesse Helms wanted to censor his photo "Piss Christ" #critlib We brought AS out to speak.

2 YEARS AGO

MontserratBiedermann
@montserratlj

A1. Does specially locating materials in anticipation of them potentially being offensive to users count for Q1? #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
A1. Library self-censorship? #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

A1: couple of years later exhibit featuring papers of inmate convicted of killing an officer was challenged by patron but remained #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Q2. What kinds of materials in your library have you & your staff found offensive?

Zoe Fisher
@zoh_zoh

Q2. What kinds of materials in your library have you & your staff found offensive? #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Zoe Fisher
@zoh_zoh

I recognize there's a lot of blurring/overlap between questions 1 (your users' definitions of offensive) and 2 (you/your staff) #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Jessica Schomberg
@schomj

A2 I also do video cataloging and have to do original records on women's studies videos that were upsetting #critlib twitter.com/zoh_zoh/status...

2 YEARS AGO

Jessica Schomberg
@schomj

A2 They weren't offensive per se, but I and our previewing tech sometimes have to see bad stuff happen to women and children #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
lurknlearn  
@nancyeadams

@scomj That brings up a pt I didn't see on the q's...trigger warnings? Anybody have to deal with them? #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Jessica Schomberg  
@scomj

I try to basically add them as subject headings when cataloging. I'll also mention stuff in linguistics BIs #critlib twitter.com/nancyeadams/st...

2 YEARS AGO

Zoe Fisher  
@zoh_zoh

@nancyeadams @scomj you're right that I didn't touch t/w or c/w with this chat... important topic tho! #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

lurknlearn  
@nancyeadams

You add trigger warnings as a subj heading? What wording do you use? @scomj #critlib twitter.com/scomj/status/...

2 YEARS AGO

Zoe Fisher  
@zoh_zoh

A2. Male faculty self-published a book about women's sexuality that made my skin crawl. I demanded we exclude it from collection. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Maura Smale  
@mauraweb

Can be hard to figure out, also for acad libs maybe diff between undergrad only & research-intensive? #critlib @nancyeadams @Gaymerbrarian

2 YEARS AGO
Q2. I don’t know if it’s ever come up, but there are political divisions among staff on Israel/Palestine & anarchism/communism... #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Q2 ...that I could see being called "offensive" by either side. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

(old red diaper babies are aghast at young anarchists working in their library, it's pretty funny) #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

@rowmyboat to paraphrase if I might, the offensive /rhetoric/ is undistinguished from offensive /content/? #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

@Gaymerbrarian how do you mean? #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

@rowmyboat that potentially objectionable materials are objected to based on presence of rhetoric not necessarily racist content #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
Lisa Hubbell  
@lisahubbell

@rowmyboat A2. Absolutely at FPOW, which had a history as a Bible college. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Tina  
@aboutness

A2 Circ staffperson came across this mplus.mnpals.net/vufind/Record/... in "Juv" collection & we were concerned. (you can see the recat I did) #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Tina  
@aboutness

And we did relocate it from the juvenile collection to "main." Which I'd stand by, although probably is a form of censorship. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Zoe Fisher  
@zoh_zoh

@aboutness wow, this is fascinating. did you discuss this during #mashcat today? #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Zoe Fisher  
@zoh_zoh

Impressed by this ex from @aboutness - adding "abuse" to subject headings for book about conversion therapy mplus.mnpals.net/vufind/Record/... #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Zoe Fisher  
@zoh_zoh

@aboutness beautiful example. this is complicated stuff! #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
@zoh_zoh Another dilemma: book isn't really about sexual reorientation programs. It indicates viewpoint, but it's also misleading. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

MARCCinaColdClimate
@marccold

A1. OH! And since *I* am also a user of my library...Irwin Stillman's diet books, which advocate that teens eat <500 kCal/day. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Jessica Schomberg
@schomj

No, bad, no. That is horrific. Like seriously harmful. wtf #critlib twitter.com/marccold/status...

2 YEARS AGO

Kevin Seебer
@kevinseebер

A2: Found this while shifting a govdocs collection: worldcat.org/title/oriental... #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Kate Crowe
@kcrowe

Yo #critlib - eating dinner, finishing up work and watching #DemsInPhilly so I'll probably be pretty quiet. (academic archivist in Denver).

2 YEARS AGO

Lisa Hubbell
@lisahubbell

A2. FPW had done weeding before I got there, some based on dated language staff found offensive. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
A2. Another example—we did a catalog search for "Negro" and removed LOTS of titles. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

A2 auxiliary point that some claims of offense are rooted in librarian vs. support staff power & culture (per @zoh_zoh's intro). #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

A2. Cataloging materials where you find the book cover offensive or the content for whatever reason might be problematic. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

A2: people are offended/shocked/intrigued/all of the above by the electric chair replica in our collection #critlib minsky.com/choice.htm

2 YEARS AGO

Q3. Is it censorship to relocate/reclassify items?

I'm going to post Q3 because lots of people have already touched on it, but please continue to add to Q1 and Q2 as you like. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Q3. Is it censorship to relocate/reclassify items? (Feel free to include your own examples!) #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
Zoe Fisher
@zoh_zoh

A3. I strongly recommend the Emily Knox reading as it relates to this question: muse.jhu.edu/article/552025 #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Jamie Howe
@Gaymerbrarian

@zoh_zoh jsyk this is behind a paywall #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

rowmyb[ike]
@rowmyboat

Q3 Depends? Is it still discoverable & available? Then not really. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Jessica Schomberg
@schomj

A3 I think this depends on intent. I often do this to make sthing MORE accessible (update SHs, fresher LCC) #critlib twitter.com/zoh_zoh/status...

2 YEARS AGO

MontserratBiedermann
@montserratj

A3. If you're a cataloger and you are asked to catalog a book expounding a view you abhor, can you "disappear" the book? #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Jamie Howe
@Gaymerbrarian

A3 #critlib this is the critical juncture for me: how is that accessibility changing and who does it help or harm? twitter.com/rowmyboat/stat...

2 YEARS AGO
The Power Of A Word

For the challengers of West Bend and their supporters, moving and labeling books was not a form of censorship. For them, censorship meant a full denial of access to the materials in question. Moving the controversial books to the adult section simply makes it more difficult for the children and youth to encounter the books, while labeling helps parents make informed choices regarding which materials are appropriate for their children to read.

The issue of the power of the majority is particularly important when it comes to defining censorship in the quotations given above because it is one of the few times in which the challenge supporters acknowledge that impeding access is based on power. Similar to the use of the term racist, in order to acknowledge that one is a censor, you must first acknowledge that you have power over another person's access to information. As Sobieraj, Berry, and Connors (2013) note, there is anxiety around political talk, of which challenges and censorship are a part. To be a censor, like being a racist, is to be a type of person of whom society disapproves. To challengers it is, by definition, a majority opinion. [End Page 748]

OT a little, but I read (but can't find now!) an article on how libraries handled archives of the infamous Wakefield Lancet study #critlib
Jessica Schomberg
@scomj
Not using the word "trigger warning" but using the content as a subject heading. Violence or abuse mostly #critlib twitter.com/nancyeadams/st...

2 YEARS AGO

Zoe Fisher
@zoh_zoh
@nancyeadams yes! a wonderful tie-in to #mashcat #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Kevin Seeber
@kevinseeber
A3: Worked at a lib that reclassified not on basis of content, but rather format. 1st eds moved to closed stacks to prevent theft. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Rowmyb[ike]
@rowmyboat
Q3 I wrote, way back when, about reclassifying what is basically erotica in YA. peopleslibrary.wordpress.com/2011/10/25/lib... #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

MontserratBiedermann
@montserratlj
A3. We have located books that might be considered pornographic, obscene in special collections. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Lisa Hubbell
@lisahubbell
A3. A less than flattering biography of the founder was routinely "missing" from the stacks if there, but left alone on reserve. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
@schomj So pretty vague? Would you put suicide in for Anna Karenina? #critlib

Jessica Schomberg
@schomj
A3 I've also been asked (usually but not always by techs) to "hide" stuff in protected collections #critlib

Ryan P. Randall
@foureyed_soul
A3 Effect of that prof's "checkout" quasi-theft meant many art books went into closed stacks for books' protection. #critlib ...

Zoe Fisher
@zoh_zoh
A3. have to recognize the great work with #mashcat about authority/offensive subj headings. #critlib docs.google.com/document/d/1mR...

Jessica Schomberg
@schomj
@metageeky If I knew that that was part of the story, yes. (And if I were doing original, which is sadly rare now) #critlib

Rachael Neu
@RachaelNeu
Honestly I haven’t encountered many objections personally, so not many answers to the qus... (1/2) #critlib
Zoe Fisher
@zoh_zoh
I'm really curious if others see this as a form of censorship. This is very similar to the NYT reading #critlib twitter.com/montserratj/s...

2 YEARS AGO

lurknlearn
@nancyeadams
#critlib A1 bit of a keruffle: Frankenstein exhibit, someone wanted to use real human brains in a display (med lib) twitter.com/nancyeadams/st...

2 YEARS AGO

Jessica Schomberg
@schomj
@fourseyedsoul We re-keyed a whole sub-library because of that #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Ryan P. Randall
@fourseyedsoul
A3.1 ...which, as shy undergrad, definitely deterred me from checking out things on David Wojnarowicz, etc. Accessibility can be key. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Zoe Fisher
@zoh_zoh
@montserratj my coworkers agreed with me, and we quietly made it disappear. he had retired & didn't ask about it. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Ben Himmelfarb
@benhimmelfarb
Anyone know the history of "urban fiction?" #critlib #critlibchat

2 YEARS AGO
@benhimmelfarb The history of it as a genre? People like to put The Coldest Winter Ever as the start of this modern Urban Fiction movement

@Tuphlos is their discussion about the genre title itself? #critlib

@zoh_zoh A2. A book cover (but I can't recall why), but we could solve it easily because we tend not to keep covers on books. #critlib

@zinelib @metageeky I feel like, if patrons actually look at the bib record, the ones who need to know will be the ones to notice #critlib

But I will just say that reducing harm & systemic oppression, aiming for actual compassion is way more imp to me than "offense." #critlib

 Depends on the context. #critlib twitter.com/zoh_zoh/status...
A3. @zoh_zoh This definitely restricts access. No browsing, have to approach staff to ask for the materials. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Zoe Fisher
@zoh_zoh

What is information without uninhibited access? #critlib twitter.com/LNBEl/status/7...

2 YEARS AGO

Jessica Schomberg
@schomj

A3 Oh, and we were asked by our Af-Am Student Assoc. to stop hiding Af-Am history books in the back of the library + #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Jessica Schomberg
@schomj

A3 cont. They weren’t just deliberately hidden; it’s just how the A-Z got layed out; response was kneejerk ”no, too $$”? 😞 #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Kate Deibel
@metageeky

@schomj This makes me curious as what locations in a large library could be construed as "hiding" #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Zoe Fisher
@zoh_zoh

The larger the library, the more "locations" in which to hide materials, maybe? #critlib twitter.com/metageeky/stat...

2 YEARS AGO
Jessica Schomberg
@scomj
I think this group of students wanted these materials more prominently displayed and more browsable #critlib twitter.com/metageeky/stat...

2 YEARS AGO

MontserratBiedermann
@montserratlj
A3. The self-censoring we do by not even buying or subscribing to the potentially-offensive to users materials in the first place. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Zoe Fisher
@zoh_zoh
A3. As someone who checked out TONS of queer erotica & books on witchcraft as a teen, I needed uninhibited access. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Zoe Fisher
@zoh_zoh
(still a gay teen witch at heart) #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Zoe Fisher
@zoh_zoh
A3. I don’t see reclassifying as censorship (e.g. moving from YA to Adult), but I do see relocating (circ to special) as censorship #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Dr.EB
@LNBel
reluctantly taken offensive/controversial/theft prone books into spec collection- why did we buy them at all if then we lock em up? #Critlib

2 YEARS AGO
Ben Himmelfarb
@benhimmelfarb

@LNBell I’ve done that—they’re historical and can benefit from contextualization in a spec coll #critlib

Ryan P. Randall
@foureysedsoul

A3.2 At college level—all patrons presumed to be adult—that very "specoll" move had very censorship effect #critlib twitter.com/zoh_zoh/status...

MontserratBiedermann
@montserratlj

Hm, wonder if critical librarianship has parameters/limiters? When would it be okay for #critlib to self-censor/censor?

Lisa Hubbell
@lisahubbell

#critlib @benhimmelfarb Nope. Met alternative HS librarian who kept it on a locked shelf and circulated only as a reward for good behavior.

Kate Deibel
@metageeky

@zoh_zoh Or more locations that someone might consider to be out of the way. Why are X books on the 4th floor instead of the 1st? #critlib

MontserratBiedermann
@montserratlj

Removing an offensive subject heading might make that material less accessible to folks who know/would look under that subject? #critlib
@zinelib Perhaps. From what I recall in this case (it's been 15-ish years), he just hoarded / kept, never discussed w/ librarians. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Kate Crowe
@kcrowe

Good gravy, I'd say no. See @justbilley's excellent work on F2659.N4 - inevermetadatadiidntlike.wordpress.com/2016/03/25/eve... #critlib twitter.com/zoh_zoh/status...

2 YEARS AGO

Zoe Fisher
@zoh_zoh

Keeping books locked up and only circulating for good behavior? *cries* #critlib twitter.com/lisahubbell/st...

2 YEARS AGO

Jamie Howe
@Gaymerbrarian

@benhimmelfarb @LNBel I kind of like this: if spec coll them, at least it's so we're collating material #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Charissa Powell
@CharissaAPowell

I think it's censorship if by relocating an item you restrict access to said item. #critlib twitter.com/zoh_zoh/status...

2 YEARS AGO

lurknlearn
@nancyeadams

check down the list...someone mentioned harmful health recommdtions, for ex #critlib twitter.com/montserratlj/s...

2 YEARS AGO
Jamie Howe @Gaymerbrarian
@benhimmelfarb @LNBell ...but, who decides context? subj liaison libs, deptmntl input? it's a rabbit hole of subjectivity itself #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Rachael Neu @RachaelNeu
Good point. #critlib twitter.com/gaymerbrarian/...

2 YEARS AGO

Kelly McElroy @kellymce
@LNBell are you suggesting that special collections...is censoring? #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Kate Deibel @metageeky
@nancyeadams Although, this could be tricky in academic libraries if you want to keep them for historical/scholarly analysis #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Zoe Fisher @zoh_zoh
@montserratlj Not just that we found it offensive, but that it could also help us find items with outdated language. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Charissa Powell @CharissaAPowell
Hi #critlib - sorry I'm late - outreach and instruction librarian in Kansas. Love tonight's topic <3

2 YEARS AGO
@montserratlj I have coll policy that I will not represent all views in health collections for med education #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

@montserratlj what would #critlib be censoring? (not a challenge, looking to understand more)

2 YEARS AGO

@metageeky @nancyeadams "But It's Historical" is a great category on Awful Library Books #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

I think that discoverability, in many ways, IS access, so reclassification could cut both ways. Promote access or censor content. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

A3. If you think of reclassifying as depriving a book of collocation with what it claims as its peers, then it becomes quite the q. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

@zoh_zoh @montserratlj YUP definitely restricts access - @99piorg had interesting episode on giftschranks: 99percentinvisible.org/episode/the-gi... #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
Kelly McElroy
@kellymce

A3: there is a useful difference between censorship as a concept and a spectrum of maximizing/minimizing access, yes? #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Rachel Walden
@rachel_w

@montserratlj For example I will not collect books treating discredited vaccine/autism or abortion/breast cancer theorize as fact #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Rachel Walden
@rachel_w

@montserratlj *theories, not theorize #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Zoe Fisher
@zoh_zoh

Great example of curating for the needs of your users. #critlib twitter.com/rachel_w/statu...

2 YEARS AGO

Zoe Fisher
@zoh_zoh

Grateful to @rachel_w for this example of "self-censoring" the collection to meet needs of users. #critlib twitter.com/rachel_w/statu...

2 YEARS AGO

Ryan P. Randall
@foureyedsoul

@rachel_w @montserratlj ...Which is interesting! I think access to those would be useful for _cultural_ scholars, but not _medical_. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
@rachel_w @montserratlj Or perhaps for medical practitioners looking to understand folk "knowledge" / medically false beliefs. #critlib

@rachel_w @montserratlj But I also wouldn't want to present that material to our nursing or other students as "factual." Thorny!!! #critlib

Hey, #critlib! I'm Callie, a librarian in LA, currently participating in #acrlimm16 in VT, mostly lurking and trying to catch up on work

@metageeky @nancyeadams what's the saying about Special Collections? Bibles and porn (or something of the like) #critlib

A question, if you know a journal article has been retracted, do you do anything to a physical copy of it? #critlib

Wow, great question for tech services folks... #critlib twitter.com/metageeky/stat...
Kelly McElroy
@kellymce

Especially because, maximizing access for some doesn’t necessarily maximize it for all. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Jessica Schomberg
@schomj

@metageeky @nancyeadams Maybe, if it aligns with curricular needs. Otherwise the potential harm is too big an ethical risk (for me) #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

michellejgibeault 🤗
mjg39 @mjg39

I once had a chat patron wondering whether the ncsu bookbot was human-mediated. #critlib twitter.com/zoh_zoh/status...

2 YEARS AGO

Charissa Powell
@CharissaAPowell

when 50 shades of grey was popular and a patron told me to pull it from the shelf because #pornography #critlib twitter.com/zoh_zoh/status...

2 YEARS AGO

Kate Crowe
@kcrowe

This q is made for spec coll - some libs have WHOLE colls of "offensive" mats-see: Wilcox Coll@kulibraries. #critlib twitter.com/zoh_zoh/status...

2 YEARS AGO

Jenna Freedman
@zinelib

Also the @WisHistory with materials many #critlib-ers may find offensive: right wing, libertarian, etc. #Danky4Ever twitter.com/kcrowe/status/...
Charissa Powell  
@CharissaAPowell

have not experienced this in my current library, but I don't work the service desk as much anymore #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Jamie Howe  
@Gaymerbrarian

@zoh_zoh @rachel_w but are we discussing censorship in coldev policy or censorship *once on the shelf*? #critlib are they different?

2 YEARS AGO

Ben Himmelfarb  
@benhimmelfarb

@Gaymerbrarian @LNBel seems simple enough to just label them old collections and apply contemp subj hdngs #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Zoe Fisher  
@zoh_zoh

@kcrowe also directly to the NYT reading for this week about the Tintin book cityroom.blogs.nytimes.com/2009/08/19/a-l... #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Rachel Walden  
@rachel_w

@foureyedslowl Agree, although the line is often blurry - more so with history of med materials #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Lisa Hubbell  
@lisahubbell

@zoh_zoh Only checking out urban lit to students who brought other books back on time, so desirable titles wouldn’t "walk". #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
Q4. How do you empower your users to be directly involved in collection development and maintenance?

Zoe Fisher
@zoh_zoh

Q4. How do you empower your users to be directly involved in collection development and maintenance? #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

((L. Braunstein)))
@laurabrarian

Hey, #critlib -- I'm Laura, academic librarian in NH, currently at #iliads16 in upstate NY. Lurking at the end of a long day.

2 YEARS AGO

Jamie Howe
@Gaymerbrarian

@kcrowe just reclassified one of these myself. I'd really like to learn more about whether this was a trend or just practice #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Kevin Seeber
@kevinseeber

@kellymce Can be hard to define that difference, no? More like difference is in intent, rather than action. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

michellejgibeault
mjg39 @mjg39

s/he wanted a book on homosexuality anonymously, and this would be possible if it was simply on the shelf, but bookbot? not so much #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
Rachel Walden
@rachel_w
@foureysouls @montserratlj I agree! #critlib
2 YEARS AGO

Kelly McElroy
@kellymce
Like, is special collections actually less accessible than a bestseller that has 500+ holds on 7 copies? #critlib
2 YEARS AGO

Jessica Schomberg
@schomj
A4 We have liaison programs with faculty. We also POD ILL requests that are new releases. #critlib twitter.com/zoh_zoh/status...
2 YEARS AGO

Kate Deibel
@metageeky
@kellymce It's easier to mark an e-article as retracted, but you might have a few big journals you still get in paper. #critlib
2 YEARS AGO

Jamie Howe
@Gaymerbrarian
@benhimmelfarb but collections by nature are assembled (they’re not numbered Pokemon) so if we’re providing context i.e scope notes #critlib
2 YEARS AGO

rowmyb[ike]
@rowmyboat
A4 We're a culture/ethnic-specific special collections, so there can be a big overlap between users & potential donors. #critlib
2 YEARS AGO
Zoe Fisher
@zoh_zoh

Thanks for this example. Sounds tricky to keep folks happy! #critlib
twitter.com/rowmyboat/stat...

Ryan P. Randall
@foureyedsoul

@rachel_w Very blurry. I’m not criticizing your decision, btw! Empathizing at how tricky collecting some material can be. #critlib

Kelly McElroy
@kellymce

@kevinseeber wait, really? Intent over impact?? #critlib

Jessica Schomberg
@schornj

A4 Our current processes are very much geared toward maintaining institutional control of every little thing #critlib

Kevin Seeber
@kevinseeber

A4: Friends! How do you do this? #pleaseandthankyou #critlib

Jessica Schomberg
@schornj

A4 And electronic resources licensing is NOT HELPFUL for this. Ahem. I have feelings on this topic. #critlib
MontserratBiedermann
@montserratj

A3, but I remember now, kinda censoring in anticipation of how faculty would react (anticipating user taking offense) #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Zoe Fisher
@zoh_zoh

@foureyedsoul @rachel_w I say to @kevinseeber at least once a day, "Wouldn't it be boring if our jobs were EASY?" #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Jamie Howe
@Gaymerbrarian

@zoh_zoh sure, but one is "our decision" and the other is almost user/peer review... is colldev self-censorship by definition? #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

((L Braunstein)))
@laurabrarian

A4. Talk to them! What do they want/need for research, teaching, learning, but also how can collection address whole community. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

rowmyb[ike]
@rowmyboat

Yeaaaahhh, sometimes Decisions Are Made to keep donors happy. @zoh_zoh #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

MontserratBiedermann
@montserratj

A3 It could be something as innocuous as "why is the library buying this cr*p?" (so not obscene, graphic) #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
Rachel Walden  
@rache_l_w  
@foureysoul thanks! I hope we get it right most of the time, but reasonable ppl could disagree #critlib

MARCinaColdClimate  
@marccold  
A4. We consult w/ local communities (eg working w/Native American Centre to get more juvenile books by Anishanaabe authors). #critlib

Kate Crowe  
@kcrowe  
Misuse of spec coll, based solely on that art. Def have stuff in our colls bc of that way of thinking tho #critlib twitter.com/zoh_zoh/status...

michellejgibeault  
@mjg39  
Rob Rucker was, <bias>of course, because he is inherently awesome </bias>, open to idea of keeping LGBTQ books out of the bookbot #critlib

rowmyb[ike]  
@rowmyboat  
...and it has led to some hilariously snarky non-public notes in the catalog records. @zoh_zoh #critlib

lurknlearn  
@nancyeadams  
it can be interp. that way, @Gaymerbrarian & critical librarianship is realizing that we are ALWAYS biased #critlib twitter.com/Gaymerbrarian/...
@kellymce As in "putting 1st ed in closed stacks to prevent theft and guarantee access" as opposed to "going to hide this crap." #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

A4: tell them how to request materials! Have a form that users can fill out! #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Awesomeness in action #critlib twitter.com/marccold/status...

2 YEARS AGO

A4. I'm new at my current institution so I'm not sure what the practice is, but overall... #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

(mostly boobies stuff). #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

A4. I feel like academic libraries are good at involving FACULTY in colldev but notsomuch students #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

At a gay bar years ago, someone had brought a stack prefilled with gay romance titles, so the requests could come from lots of ppl. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
A4. We prominently feature (on home page & in one-shots) a "Request It" form; all but implore patrons to help us build collection. #critlib

Tina
@aboutness

Only slightly related, but was irritating that some construed "Illegal aliens" LCSH effort as about desire to never cause offense. #critlib

Jenna Freedman
@zinelib

A4: Do academic library folks engage student advisory groups in selection? We've all *begged* faculty to weigh in...amirite? #critlib

Lisa Hubbell
@lisahubbell

A4. Library website has a button to submit requests for items to add to collection. Try to purchase frequent ILL items. #critlib

Jamie Howe
@Gaymerbrarian

@foureyed soul do students know they can / believe they should? #critlib

michellejgibeault 🦩
mjg39 @mjg39

not sure of their current policies... Incidentally, this use case I herald when colleagues think email should be required for chat #critlib
@foureyedsoul I mean, listening to students is why Rutgers has a recreational reading section in multiple libs, but academically? #critlib

Ryan P. Randall
@foureyedsoul

A4.1 My standard exhortation is "Collecting for a library is like throwing a party for people you don't know. We want your help!" #critlib

Jessica Schomberg
@schomj

A4 I love/hate forms. Works for some people but putting names on a form that might ID private info is 😞 #critlib twitter.com/kellymce/statu...

Kevin Seeber
@kevinseeber

@kellymce I think if special collections requires photo ID and bag inspection, yeah. #critlib

Jessica Schomberg
@schomj

@kellymce but I love that your library allows that. MPOW is much more restrictive #critlib

Jamie Howe
@Gaymerbrarian

@schomj who needs a name? ;P maybe just departmental affiliation/course of study #critlib
Zoe Fisher
@zoh_zoh

Love this. Because I love parties. And libraries. LIBRARY PARTY #critlib
twitter.com/foureyedsoul/s...
2 YEARS AGO

((L Braunstein)))
@laurabrarian

A4. Also? Not 2nd-guess every decision. Have general guidelines for collections but practice self-care, no micromanaging. #critlib
2 YEARS AGO

Kelly McElroy
@kellymce

@kevinseeber but if the effect on the user is the same...does it matter? No one will know! #critlib
2 YEARS AGO

Rachel Walden
@rachel_w

@schomj @kellymce I would especially want a no-name option in a public library #critlib
2 YEARS AGO

Zoe Fisher
@zoh_zoh

Friends, this has been rad! Thanks so much to everyone for participating, reading, and thinking tonight. #critlib
2 YEARS AGO

Kate Deibel
@metageekky

@Gaymerbrarian @schomj There's also the issue that the ILS might capture names without telling the user. #badILSNocookie #critlib
2 YEARS AGO
@Gaymerbrarian They certainly seem to believe? Hard to judge though; same form is used for ILL as for purchase. But requests daily. #critlib

@kevinseeber and what about all the unconscious bias? I’m sure that happens with this stuff, and the *intent* isn’t there then. #critlib

@schomj but it makes me think even in acad med someone may want LGBT health, sex ed etc title & not want to ID #critlib

Yes - if it's "hide this stuff" not "protect this valuable, rare thing" ur doin spec coll wrong. #critlib twitter.com/kevinseeber/st...

A4 We used to have setup where half of collection budget was given to departments, they did their own selection. Many pros & cons. #critlib

@aboutness But now the budget has been so dramatically cut that we can’t do it anymore. #critlib
Conclusions

Zoe Fisher  
@zoh_zoh

We have a few minutes left for pitches and closing thoughts. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Zoe Fisher  
@zoh_zoh

I am grateful to everyone who asked questions, added catalog records, and suggested related readings. You make me love my job. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Lisa Hubbell  
@lisahubbell

Many thanks to @zoh_zoh for modding a great #critlib chat, and to everyone who de-lurked and participated.

2 YEARS AGO

Jessica Schomberg  
@schomj

We invited the head of uni LGBT group to talk and that's one thing she warned about. Even checkout is iffy #critlib twitter.com/rachel_w/status...
@kevinseeber I guess my point is, access isn't linear -- different restrictions affect different ppl differently. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

@kellymce Yeah, exactly! I'm saying consequence is same, so it's worth exploring motivations. #critlib #ithinkweagreeandtwitteristooshort

2 YEARS AGO

@kellymce But I'm not sure how often we get/approve requests for more recreations reading material, now that I think about it. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

closing #critlib thought: censorship isn't quite as is/isn't as ALA would like us to believe it is

2 YEARS AGO

@kevinseeber @kellymce maybe for working parents. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

@kellymce @schomj Good point I'd want option to suggest item w/out doing that #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
Jessica Schomberg
@scomj
@marccold @kellymce I requested a book on mental health and our ILL person warned me that everybody would know my business #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Jamie Howe
@Gaymerbrarian
@scomj @marccold @kellymce well, at least they're looking out for you ¬.¬; #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Zoe Fisher
@zoh_zoh
@montserratlj "representing all views" = way easier said than done #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Kate Deibel
@metageeky
@montserratlj In fiction, of course. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Tina
@aboutness
@rachel_w @scomj @kellymce Our form brings in a ton of requests that are from self-publishing authors promoting their books. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Zoe Fisher
@zoh_zoh
All right, folks, you can keep going but we're outta time. Take care & be safe, eat your green veggies, and don't stay up too late! #critlib

2 YEARS AGO
@aboutness @rachel_w @schomj @kellymce self-publishing should be its own #critlib chat... maybe it already has been? oof. tough stuff.

2 YEARS AGO

@aboutness @rachel_w @schomj I mean, the form has to happen alongside a CM policy... #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

I loved the call I got at a museum from "an author of an anti-evolution book you have in your library" who had donated it himself. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

In reality, it would be a harder decision to make, as someone said, "thorny" how to handle potentially offensive materials/thoughts. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

@kevinseeber @kellymce we have lockers for bags. They don't have access, bag's safe, we don't have to check. win/win. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Thanks for a very thought-provoking #critlib, @zoh_zoh! Thinking a lot about the intent/impact bit in what folks were saying.

2 YEARS AGO
lurklearn
@nancyeadams
probs one reason I don't have to deal with censorship at my lib is we don't have enough $ to buy books...j's take it all :( #critlib

michellejgibeault
mjg39 @mjg39
This is why we #critlib, no? twitter.com/deannaraybourn...

Jamie Howe
@Gaymerbrarian
man, #critlib is great at reminding me that just because I don't have a job, that doesn't mean I don't have a library voice #jokes

Rebecca Bramlett
@RBriram
@zoh_zoh Thanks for letting me de-lurk at #critlib!

Ryan P. Randall
@foureyedsoul
@Gaymerbrarian I've been pondering this since an earlier tweet of yours. Are you thinking it's more "for whom, in what ways"? #critlib

Zoe Fisher
@zoh_zoh
@mjg39 I #critlib because it keeps my skin soft, smooth, and blemish-free

Maura Smale
@mauraweb
Thanks for modding a great #critlib @zoh_zoh and to everyone for the convo!
@foureyedsoul hrn, I can see wherefrom that conclusion. More that the very concept of censorship isn't a straightforward thing #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

@zoh_zoh Thanks for letting me crash #critlib a little. Forgot to lurk! Oh, man, and got carried away towards the end there.

2 YEARS AGO

@zoh_zoh Thanks for running a great #critlib chat! Very interesting convos!

2 YEARS AGO

@foureyedsoul that "always against it" is oversimplifying and not precisely "am for it", for the sake of slogans #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Jessica Schomberg
@schomj

A1 Going back to the beginning in reflection: for me there's a big difference between offensive+oppressive #critlib twitter.com/zoh_zoh/status...

2 YEARS AGO

MontserratBiedermann
@montserratlj

Phew, I have no idea where I was in the #critlib in the last few minutes there. Forgot to lurk! Back to trying to write.

2 YEARS AGO
Jessica Schomberg  
@scomj

A1 cont. I'm fairly nonchalant about offensive, but I will get on my high horse about oppressive. That can be blurry too tho #critlib  

2 YEARS AGO

Ryan P. Randall  
@foureysdoulsoul

@zoh_zoh @Gaymerbrarian Yeah. Is censorship ~"impeded access" or ~"intentional obstruction"? Very different. Thanks for tonight's #critlib  

2 YEARS AGO

Jessica Schomberg  
@scomj

A1 IDK. I have no answers, I guess. But I'm very happy @zoh_zoh challenged us with these great questions! #critlib  

2 YEARS AGO

Lisa Hubbell  
@lisahurbell

@montserratlj @zoh_zoh I've often thought I wouldn't have anything to say on a #critlib topic, and then good examples spark convos.  

2 YEARS AGO

h.pole.free  
@haylmail

Stumbled upon #mashcat as a thing while catching up on #critlib posts - @theFordon check it out! twitter.com/erinaleach/sta...  

2 YEARS AGO

Dr.EB  
@LNBel

Late return to #critlib to clarify I'm for access thru SpecColl for truly rare/unique materials in mission, not theft prone/offensive books  

2 YEARS AGO
Dr.EB
@LNBel

If something is potentially offensive/stealable and not rare, we should stand by acquisition decisions & shelve in stacks #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Dr.EB
@LNBel

ie: just buy 20 copies of all the serial killer bios for the library, and replace as they disappear, or look for ebooks #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

Kelly Swickard
@k_swickard

Sorry miss #mashcat weeding bks/discov. prob. authority rec. for transgender person not updated & bad LCSH/how to handle outdated #critlib

2 YEARS AGO