


by Nimisha Bhat 2 years ago


# #critlib 11/02/15: lc classification

storified tweet archive of the 11/02/15 #critlib chat on dismantling white, upper class, cisgender, & colonial LC classification

## Introductions

 **Nimisha Bhat**  
@mishiebhath  
mishiebhath


Hey #critlib - it's time for another fantastic chat on LC classification! Roll call - introduce yourself and where you're chatting from.

 2 YEARS AGO


 **kyle shockey**  
@kshockey04  
kshockey04


hey #critlib kyle, northwest indiana, unemployed cataloger type; lurking due to interview later.

 2 YEARS AGO


 **Charlotte E. Price**  
@PoorCharlotte  
PoorCharlotte Charlotte


Hi #critlib! Academic librarian Charlotte reporting from NYC, whilst eating lunch.

 2 YEARS AGO


 **Laurel Narizny**  
@ekelistic  
@ekelistic

Hi #critlib, I'm Laurel, a systems librarian and original cataloger at an academic library in California.

 2 YEARS AGO

 **April Hathcock**  
@AprilHathcock  
AprilHathcock

I'm April, academic lib in NYC, tweeting from an open science meeting in Berkeley. #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO



**Netanel Ganin**

OpOnions @OpOnions

Hey #CritLib, I'm Netanel, cataloger out of the Boston area -- he/him/his



2 YEARS AGO



**Netanel Ganin**

OpOnions @OpOnions

Hey who wrote something relevant to this week's #CritLib over the weekend? Why, it was me!  
[inevermetadataididntlike.wordpress.com/2015/10/31/ant...](http://inevermetadataididntlike.wordpress.com/2015/10/31/ant...)



2 YEARS AGO



**Violet Fox**

@violetbfox

Hi #critlib! I'm a cataloger/metadata librarian at a small-ish university in the middle of Minnesota. Thrilled about this topic!



2 YEARS AGO



**Adam Mizelle**

adammizelle @adammizelle

Hi #critlib. Adam, Ref and Inst librarian from Widener U in Chester PA. Limited participation today due to not having done the readings.



2 YEARS AGO



**Nora Almeida**

nora\_almeida @nora\_almeida

Hi #critlib. I'm Nora, Instruction academic librarian from NYC. Hooray for daytime chats.



2 YEARS AGO



**Kevin Seeber**

@kevinseeber

Hi #critlib! Kevin here. Academic instruction person in Denver. Finding it slightly odd to be chatting during my lunch hour?



2 YEARS AGO



**Megan Browndorf**  
@LiberryCobbler

Hi #critlib -- Megan, Research & Instruction Librarian in Maryland.

 2 YEARS AGO



**Barnard Library**  
barnlib @barnlib

This is Jenna #critlib-ing from NYC. I blog about #LCSH sometimes [lowereastsidelibrarian.info/taxonomy/term/...](http://lowereastsidelibrarian.info/taxonomy/term/...) (sorry for the error msg on my website)

 2 YEARS AGO



**Joanna Gadsby**  
jkgadsby@jkgadsby

Hi daytime #critlib! Joanna from Baltimore, instruction librarian.

 2 YEARS AGO



**Danielle Jacobs**  
@DanjelleJ

Hello #critlib , Danielle Cataloging Librarian and Student from Pratt Int. from NYC here!

 2 YEARS AGO



**Rory Litwin**  
rorylitwin@rorylitwin

Hello #critlib ... I'm tweeting from the desk at @LibJuicePress ... Not a cataloger, but interested in these issues. Mostly lurking.

 2 YEARS AGO



**Wendy Robertson**  
wendycr@wendycr\_

#critlib Hi I'm Wendy, former serials cataloger, Iowa City, academic library

 2 YEARS AGO



**Stevie Feliciano**  
StevieFeliciano

Hey! I'm an Information Assistant @nypl specializing in children and teen services! Also getting my MLS from @PrattInfoSchool #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO

**Jennifer**

@gonesquirrelly

#critlib lurking from Windsor, Ontario!


 2 YEARS AGO



**Ian Beilin**

@ibeilin

Hi #critlib, Ian here, academic librarian in nyc excited to learn from #critcatalogers!

 2 YEARS AGO



**Tim Spalding**

@librarythingtim

@librarythingtim Hi #critlib. I'm the founder of LibraryThing and generally interested in classification theory. Mostly lurking.

 2 YEARS AGO



**Anna Neatrou**

@annaneat

Hi #critlib , I'm Anna, metadata librarian in Utah.

 2 YEARS AGO



**Lindsay Cronk**

linds\_bot@linds\_bot

#critlib eresources librarian in Houston! Excited for today's topic, though mostly here to observe.

 2 YEARS AGO



**Coral Sheldon-Hess**

web\_librarian@web\_librarian

Hi, #critlib! I'm Coral, a librarian and developer in Pittsburgh, PA.

 2 YEARS AGO



**Mohamed Berray**

MohamedBerray@MohamedBerray

@meta\_cat thought you might be interested in today's #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO



**chiuchiutrain**

chiuchiutrain

Hi #critlib - I'm Anastasia, lurking from Temple University; currently in reference, soon to rotate to acquisitions, then cataloging.



2 YEARS AGO



**MARCinaColdClimate**

marccold

Hi #critlib ! Cataloger from Michigan, lurking on her lunch hour.



2 YEARS AGO



**J. Turner Masland**

deweysnotdead

hey #critlib! Turner Masland, Access Services/Resource Sharing professional at Portland State University Library



2 YEARS AGO



**Melissa Coulston**

@melissamsmc

Hi #critlib. Melissa, nearly done LIS student. Looking forward to the discussion!



2 YEARS AGO



**Shana L. McDanold**

@slmcdanold

Hi #critlib! Unit Head of Metadata Services here.



2 YEARS AGO



**Jaime, a librarian**

rowmyboat

Hey #critlib! I'm a systems librarian in NYC. I work on the meta-metadata.



2 YEARS AGO



**Jen Hoyer**

jenhoyer

Hey #critlib! I'm one of the library folk at @InterferenceArc and am stoked for this chat...in and out of meetings, so might catch up later!



2 YEARS AGO



**Jessica Colbert**

Jessica Colbert  
@JessicaColbert

Hi #critlib! MLIS student here. Hopeful future cataloger. Sandy Berman wanna-be.



2 YEARS AGO



**Jonathan Cope**

Jonathan Cope  
@stupidplover

Hi #critlib I am a reference/instruction/generalist lurking while I work.



2 YEARS AGO



**Sara Howard**

Sara Howard  
@foreverforward

Yes! Hi, Sara, research librarian from CT #critlib [twitter.com/PoorCharlotte/...](https://twitter.com/PoorCharlotte/)



2 YEARS AGO



**Ethan Fenichel**

Ethan Fenichel  
@EthanDF

Hi! Ethan from Florida - doing technical services stuff - following along #critlib



2 YEARS AGO

**Patricia Gimenez**

Patricia Gimenez  
@TriciaGimenez

I'm Patricia and I do reference/instruction in Savannah #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Donna Witek**

Donna Witek  
@donnarosemary

(btw #critlib I'm Donna acad ref/instruction lib\*n in PA lurking bc just got to work& will be doing email triage as I learn from all of you)



2 YEARS AGO



**Derrick**


Derrick  
@geekandahalf

Keeping an eye on #critlib; Derrick from DC, ref/instr academic librarian in the midst of office hours. \*waves\*





2 YEARS AGO

**Q1: How does LCSH affect the work you do at your institution (or wherever you encounter it!)**


 **Nimisha Bhat**  
mishiebhat / mishiebhat


Welcome all! As more join us, let's start jumping into Q1: How does LCSH affect the work you do at your institution? [#critlib](#)

 2 YEARS AGO

 **Nimisha Bhat**  
mishiebhat / mishiebhat


[@mishiebhat](#) LCSH = Library of Congress Subject Headings [#critlib](#)

 2 YEARS AGO


 **Danielle Jacobs**  
@DanjelleJ


I know when I catalog anything relating to Native Americans, We instead put it under Indians of North America T\_T (relating to Q1) [#critlib](#)

 2 YEARS AGO


 **Charlotte E. Price**  
PoorCharlotte / Charlotte


A1: I'm a research librarian, so LCSH determines how I find anything in the catalog, teach students, & also do acquisitions [#critlib](#)

 2 YEARS AGO


 **Violet Fox**  
@violetbfox

A1. LCSH is less relevant for users as we've moved to OCLC's Discovery, which currently doesn't really do advanced browsing well. [#critlib](#)

 2 YEARS AGO

 **Violet Fox**  
@violetbfox

[@violetbfox](#) ...and as we provide more searchable keywords in records. Those keywords often come directly from item being described. [#critlib](#)

 2 YEARS AGO



**Shana L. McDanold**

@slmcdanold

A1: we use LCSH in multiple systems (catalog, institutional repository, etc.) but we try to incorporate other vocabs when needed [#critlib](#)

2 YEARS AGO



**Netanel Ganin**

OpOnionsOpOnions

A1 it affects my work everyday -- I create orig. records and enhance records -- both using [#LCSH](#) [#CritLib](#)

2 YEARS AGO



**Netanel Ganin**

OpOnionsOpOnions

A1.2 and that means that the choices we \*have\* in the vocabulary end up in records disseminated across the world [#CritLib](#)

2 YEARS AGO



**Netanel Ganin**

OpOnionsOpOnions

A1.3 So, that vocab \*matters\* a heckuvalot [#CritLib](#)

2 YEARS AGO



**Coral Sheldon-Hess**

web\_librarianweb\_librarian

A1: I am currently institutionless. 😞 Subject headings are less important for my current work than name and title authority. [#critlib](#)

2 YEARS AGO



**Megan Browndorf**

@LiberryCobbler

[#critlib](#) A1: I do instruction about how to use LCSH for better browsing with students, talking about and teaching organization of knowledge

2 YEARS AGO





**Barnard Library**

barnlib @barnlib

A1: I catalog works by living creators. Sometimes they don't like the #LCSH I assign/that exist, like Sexual minorities for queer. #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Kevin Seeber**

@kevinseeber

A1-Though I'm not a cataloger, LCSH (and all metadata) play a big role in my work w/r/t ref & inst. "Search with these words." #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Adam Mizelle**

adammmizelle @adammmizelle

A1: I will be starting a collection eval on how robust our support for scholarship of diversity is. ID the relevant SHs to start? #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Jaime, a librarian**

rowmyboat @rowmyboat

A1 I work at a cultural institution that uses SEVERAL vocabs, not just LCSH, because we need them all. It's a hot mess. #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Melissa Coulston**

@melissamsmc

A1 can be very helpful for remote catalog searches. I really miss browsing stacks #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Joanna Gadsby**

jkgadsby @jkgadsby

A1. LCSH plays role when teaching students how to search. It's not the only tool used, but it's there so we talk about it. #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**kyle shockey**

kshockey@shockey04

A1: subject headings allow me as an unemployed person to browse library holdings off-site for research. [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Barnard Library**

barnlib @barnlib

A1: my relationships with the people whose work I describe is important to me personally & professionally so bad [#LCSH](#) is a drag. [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Charlotte E. Price**

PoorCharlotteCharlotte

A1.2 Until recently, I used to catalog a lot (for music) which really restricted options since LCSH are used in lieu of genre terms [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Jaime, a librarian**

rowmyboatrowmyboat

A1 We proly use LCSH the most, though. As systems person, I was recently playing with SH display in Primo, our discovery layer... [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Karl Ericson**

kinderone@kinderone1

A1: LCSH's obfuscate information unnecessarily. Slow to change or add new. Need to be more intuitive [#critlib](#) [#mytwocents](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**MARCinaColdClimate**

marccold@marccold

A1. [#LCSH](#) - the primary vocabulary we use in lib cataloging. I think most users' lib experiences are more affected by [#LCC](#), though. [#critlib](#)




2 YEARS AGO

Jennifer

@gonesquirrelly

A1. Find that subj headings most relevant when full text searches don't work or info on subject too sparse, then handy. #critlib


 2 YEARS AGO



J. Turner Masland

deweys@coleray.com

#critlib A1: discoverability. Both for our own patrons within our collection and for other patrons through interlibrary loan

 2 YEARS AGO



Danielle Jacobs

@DanjelleJ

A1: for my institute it would be hard to transfer material to the new subject headings because of the sheer volume of it 500k+ #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO

Jennifer

@gonesquirrelly

A1. In full text searching world how much do subj headings matter? #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO



Stevie Feliciano

StevieFeliciano

A1: I'm not a cataloger either but it does play a large role for me as a student #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO



Nora Almeida

nora\_almeida

A1: Important for discovery. But in instruction context, feel like LCSH / keyword distinction is challenge for students. #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO



**Charlotte E. Price**

PoorCharlotteCharlotte

A1.3 the pickiness/outdatedness of some LCSH makes it v. tough for patrons to find items sometimes. They blame themselves, too [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Jaime, a librarian**

rowmyboatrowmyboat

A1 + because we'd realized the original setup wasn't displaying the hierarchical nature of LCSH at all. Oops! [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**April Hathcock**

AprilHathcockAprilHathcock

A1 As a [#scholcomm](#) libr, LCSH shows me how researchers work will b organized/distributed/found (or not). Also shows what's valued. [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Nimisha Bhat**

mishiebhatmishiebhat

[@gonessquirrelly](#) A great question that I ask myself often! I'd like to see a comprehensive study of this. Is there one out there? [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Netanel Ganin**

OpOnionsOpOnions

A1 love a cute [#LCSH](#), a funny one, an oddball one - but is v. imp. to ne. lose sight of the fact that these terms rep. a sing. view [#CritLib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Kevin Seeber**

@kevinseeber

[@nora\\_almeida](#) Definitely! I usually save controlled vocab discussion for consultations or upper div instruction. [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Megan Browndorf**

@LiberryCobbler

@gonesquirrelly #critlib I find my students often don't have the vocab to adequately full-text search. LCSH help adv students get there.


 2 YEARS AGO



**Coral Sheldon-Hess**

web\_librarian

A1 @gonesquirrelly Some indexes (I think Summon is one) prioritize expert-applied metadata over full-text. #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO



**Laurel Narizny**

@ekelistic

A1 LCSH less relevant now that we have a keyword-centered discovery layer, but I do still assign in original cataloging. #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO



**Shana L. McDanold**

@slmcdanold

A1: there are several studies (including covering dissertation use) proving that controlled LCSH increases circulation/findability #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO



**Charlotte E. Price**

PoorCharlotte

And outdatedness often = racist/sexist/homophobic terms are used bc. they were "the norm" #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO



**Coral Sheldon-Hess**

web\_librarian

A1 @gonesquirrelly And then, of course, not everything in the catalog is available for full-text search, so it gets weird. #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO



**Nora Almeida**

nora\_almeida @nora\_almeida

@violetbfox @gonessquirrelly Agree that LCSH are less important but we still need em for books. #critlib



2 YEARS AGO

**Jennifer**

@gonessquirrelly

Isn't collocation in e-world search results grouped by search terms used in conjunction, not assigned subj #critlib [twitter.com/jessicalcolber...](https://twitter.com/jessicalcolber...)



2 YEARS AGO



**Netanel Ganin**

OpOnions @OpOnions

A1 #CritLib -- #LCSH tells us the libs. and them, the patrons -- here's YOU. You are a "sexual minority" not "queer"



2 YEARS AGO



**Kevin Seeber**

@kevinseeber

@mishiebhat @gonessquirrelly Don't know about specific studies, but using controlled vocab seems to influence relevancy ranking IME. #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Jaime, a librarian**

rowmyboat @rowmyboat

.@gonessquirrelly I think it still does! Collation of things under one term that might get several different with natural language. #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**MARCinaColdClimate**

marccold @marccold

ITA with this- controlled vocabularies can bring a lot of joy, as well as having terrible probs. #critlib [twitter.com/OpOnions/statu...](https://twitter.com/OpOnions/statu...)



2 YEARS AGO



**Barnard Library**

barnlib @barnlib

A1: there is a less visible aspect of #LCSH--how they boost relevance to a record/results sort. #critlib Systems folks, can you comment?



2 YEARS AGO

**Patricia Gimenez**

@TriciaGimenez

@LiberryCobbler @gonessquirrelly I tell my students to browse subject headings to give them new keyword vocabulary #critlib



2 YEARS AGO

**Jennifer**

@gonessquirrelly

So subj headings used for "crippled" texts, DVDs etc...things not fully searchable yet? #critlib [twitter.com/web\\_librarian/...](https://twitter.com/web_librarian/)



2 YEARS AGO



**Laurel Narizny**

@ekelistic

I'm not clear on how LCSH influences our EDS rankings, but would love to hear about this from others. #critlib [twitter.com/barnlib/status...](https://twitter.com/barnlib/status...)



2 YEARS AGO

**Jennifer**

@gonessquirrelly

Books or e-books? #critlib [twitter.com/nora\\_almeida/s...](https://twitter.com/nora_almeida/s...)



2 YEARS AGO



**Nora Almeida**

nora\_almeida @nora\_almeida

@gonessquirrelly Both. Lots of our ebooks aren't full text searchable. #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Danielle Jacobs**

@DanjelleJ

I personally think learning how to catalog with #LCSH has expanded my vocab, but with lack up term update it can really mess ppl up #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Laurel Narizny**

@ekelistic

@barnlib Also interested in how genre terms might influence relevance. #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Kevin Seeber**

@kevinseeber

@barnlib Not a systems person, but my work w/ web scale disc mostly found relevancy is a black box. But yeah, LCSH seem to factor? #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Coral Sheldon-Hess**

web\_librarian

A1 @gonessquirrelly Exactly. They use what we give them if the item doesn't have full-text indexed. #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**MARCinaColdClimate**

marccold

@rowmyboat @gonessquirrelly There have been great articles by A. Taylor/T. Gross about how #LCSH improve results for keyword search. #critlib



2 YEARS AGO

**Jennifer**

@gonessquirrelly

But currency of headings is a described issue...so use for IL purposes? #critlib  
[twitter.com/liberrycobbler...](https://twitter.com/liberrycobbler...)



2 YEARS AGO





**Jaime, a librarian**

rowmyboat

And, anyway, how do you full-text search something that's not text? [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Derrick**

@geekandahalf

A1 I'll never stop giving shout outs to our tech svcs folks because the work they do allows me to do my thing in ref/inst. [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**DPWaybrarian**

@DPWayman

Hi, Pacific NW academic cataloger here. A1-We use LCSH so I perform subject analysis on all records with an eye to enhancing them. [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Coral Sheldon-Hess**

web\_librarian

A1 I think a lot of people forget that we don't have full-text for everything, even post-Google Books. Metadata matters! [#CritLib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Nora Almeida**

nora\_almeida

[@kevinseeber](#) [@barnlib](#) seriously! Secret algorithms irk me. I want to know what my discovery tool means by 'relevancy' [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Brett D. Currier**

brettdcurrier

A1.1 even if the words I'm LCSH change we still have problems of cross comparing [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Brett D. Currier**

brettdcurrier

A1.2 compare the LCSH for the black panthers vs the kkk and look at the race neutrality of language of the klan vs bp #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Brett D. Currier**

brettdcurrier

A 1.3 It is both the taxonomy language but then the application of the taxonomy to the thing. #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Shana L. McDanold**

@slmcdanold

A1: LCSH is limited to one world view (anglo-saxon white male generally); which is why we supplement with additional vocabularies #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Shana L. McDanold**

@slmcdanold

A1: and don't forget #genre headings! #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Coral Sheldon-Hess**

web\_librarian

A1 @gonesquirrelly Summon uses LCSH for subject facets. #critlib



2 YEARS AGO

**Jennifer**

@gonesquirrelly

LCSH now like my living room couch. No one notices it until it disappears? #critlib and there is other seating! [twitter.com/rowmyboat/stat...](https://twitter.com/rowmyboat/stat...)



2 YEARS AGO

**Q2. Is there a better alternative to the SACO process of LCSH review to ensure that change happens?**



**Nimisha Bhat**

mishiebhat @mishiebhat

A1: Interesting to see how LCSH affects everyone's work differently! Keeping that in mind... #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Nimisha Bhat**

mishiebhat @mishiebhat

Q2. Is there a better alternative to the SACO process of LCSH review to ensure that change happens? #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Nimisha Bhat**

mishiebhat @mishiebhat

Q2. SACO = Subject Authority Cooperative Program. In other words, what's a better way to enact a swifter change in terms? #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Charlotte E. Price**

PoorCharlotte @PoorCharlotte

A2 I sure wish there were a better review process. So far have gotten turned down for every suggested change re: Fat Studies. #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Barnard Library**

barnlib @barnlib

@PoorCharlotte Me, too! [lowereastside librarian.info/fatacceptancep...](http://lowereastside librarian.info/fatacceptancep...) #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Netanel Ganin**

OpOnions @OpOnions

@PoorCharlotte and the proposal form is awful! #CritLib



2 YEARS AGO



**Netanel Ganin**

OpOnions @OpOnions

Q2 -- as a non-member (yet?) I find the SACO process obscure and distant. #CritLib

2 YEARS AGO



**Stevie Feliciano**

StevieFeliciano @StevieFeliciano

Q2: There has to be a better alternative to SACO process. It should not take years for a subject heading to change #thanksberman #critlib

2 YEARS AGO



**Nimisha Bhat**

mishiebhat @mishiebhat

@OpOnions It does seem like a pretty mysterious process, doesn't it? Answer three riddles, find a golden key...? #critlib

2 YEARS AGO



**Charlotte E. Price**

PoorCharlotte @PoorCharlotte

@OpOnions yes! esp. when one is not a member of SACO, you're totally cut out of the process. Which is a LOT of important libraries #critlib

2 YEARS AGO



**Netanel Ganin**

OpOnions @OpOnions

A2 -- it feels distant to the work we do daily -- TERMS DESCEND FROM ON HIGH "yes to this" "nahhhh we feel what we have is suff." #CritLib

2 YEARS AGO



**Charlotte E. Price**

PoorCharlotte @PoorCharlotte

@barnlib yes! Lots of <3 to you, Sandy Berman, and many others petitioning for change from SACO #critlib

2 YEARS AGO



**Danielle Jacobs**

@DanjelleJ

A2 ppl use volume of collection as excuse to keep horrible SH which makes vocab advancement dang near impossible to fix/update #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Shana L. McDanold**

@slmcdanold

A2: Technically, ANYONE can submit a #LCSH or #genre proposal to #SACO: [loc.gov/aba/pcc/saco/p...](http://loc.gov/aba/pcc/saco/p...) #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Nimisha Bhat**

~~mishiebhat~~ mishiebhat

A2: I find it difficult to comprehend how a circle of a few institutions gets say in the matter and it isn't a more open process #critlib



2 YEARS AGO

**Jennifer**

@gonessquirrelly

Limited use(s) or relevance of LCSH then? Assumption of LCSH as holistically useful breaking down? #critlib [twitter.com/web\\_librarian/...](https://twitter.com/web_librarian/)



2 YEARS AGO



**Tim Spalding**

@librarythingtim

@null Q2. Dare I suggest a distributed, no-final-authority system? Could be messy. But LCSH in the "wild" is pretty wild already. #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**J. Turner Masland**

~~deweysnotdead~~ deweysnotdead

Q2 maybe if we get an actual librarian as librarian of congress we can see some improvements?? #critlib #loc #librarianofprogress



2 YEARS AGO



**Laurel Narizny**

@ekelistic

A2 I know I say this for everything, but linked data. Allow everyone to add variants, and we can choose which to use. #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Christina Harlow**

cm\_harlow @cm\_harlow

A2. (butting in) empower yourselves by learning how LOD + non-trad data can extend/explode trad concept/gated area of 'authorities' #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Violet Fox**

@violetbfox

A2. Grateful for @barnlib's efforts to share/publicize efforts to change LCSH terms, see her website: [lowereastsidelibrarian.info/taxonomy/term/...](http://lowereastsidelibrarian.info/taxonomy/term/...) #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Megan Browndorf**

@LiberryCobbler

@gonessquirrelly #critlib I see currency issues as teaching moment. To me IL is pulling back the curtain on info creation process. LCSH inc



2 YEARS AGO



**Caligula von Bingen**

@marxalot

Think both the large slow and the small fast models have advantage: they push and check each other. #critlib [twitter.com/librarythingti...](https://twitter.com/librarythingti...)



2 YEARS AGO



**Barnard Library**

barnlib @barnlib

And full text doesn't always contain useful descriptive terms. +1 #MetadataMatters #critlib [twitter.com/web\\_librarian/...](https://twitter.com/web_librarian/...)



2 YEARS AGO



**Laurel Narizny**

@ekelistic

A lot like cooperative cataloging, in fact. Let everyone contribute. We have a lot more experts than are SACO members. [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Coral Sheldon-Hess**

web\_librarian

Caveat: I don't work for ProQuest, haven't seen their code. I am repeating what we were told when we asked these q's at MFPOW. [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Ian Beilin**

@ibeilin

@slmcdanold This was underscored in the interview w/Tillett - she says LC serves congress members - look who they are, have been! [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**DPWaybrarian**

@DPWayman

A2-Possibly, but regulation produces stability & consistency; rapid change could create difficulties for authorization and control. [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Rory Litwin**

rorylitwin

2 separate issues: LC's specific choices in SH, general issue of having an authoritative, hierarchical SH system. [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**John Mark Ockerbloom**

@JMarkOckerbloom

I find links to LCSH terms from other places (e.g. related terms, Wikipedia, FAST) make it easier to find right one for what I seek [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Caligula von Bingen**

@marxalot

As long as you can fund the backend operators, this times a million. #critlib  
[twitter.com/ekelistic/stat...](https://twitter.com/ekelistic/stat...)


 2 YEARS AGO



**Nora Almeida**

nora\_almeida@nora\_almeida

@LiberryCobbler @gonessquirrelly but hard to handle critical analysis of LCSH & knowledge prod & research strategies in a one-shot #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO



**J. Turner Masland**

deweysnotdead@jturner

#critlib as a non-cataloger, great to learn about SACO!

 2 YEARS AGO



**MARCinaColdClimate**

marccold@marccold

A2. I sometimes wish we could discuss new #LCSH more openly- have physical or virtual fora. #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO



**Violet Fox**

@violetbfox

@ekelistic That's the way NACO is going, encouragingly, but not sure LC would be willing to let go of tight control of LCSH. #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO



**Karl Ericson**

kinderone@kinderone1

@marxalot But where is the "small fast" model to balance the large slow SACO? #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO





**kyle shockey**

kshockey04

a2 - has anyone considered the problematic terminology we use? "authority and control" #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**kyle shockey**

kshockey04

a2.1 it's hard to fight for decentralized, democratic institutions and subsequently support the LCSH system. #critlib



2 YEARS AGO

**Jennifer**

@gonessquirrelly

@nora\_almeida @LiberryCobbler nice place to be contrary though! And interesting. #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Danielle Jacobs**

@DanjelleJ

Apparently the ppl making Authority Rs make jack squat in pay (takes my super. weeks to get AR. updated) GL with diverse SH #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Caligula von Bingen**

@marxalot

Don't look to The Institution for swift response: a LOT of disadvantages go with being big and "powerful" #critlib [twitter.com/ibeilin/status...](https://twitter.com/ibeilin/status...)



2 YEARS AGO



**John Mark Ockerbloom**

@JMarkOckerbloom

I'm not saying it's ideal by any means, but it might be interesting to compare & contrast how WP & SACO do subject auth control #critlib



2 YEARS AGO

**Jennifer**

@gonesquirrelly

Q2. Don't think crowdsourcing as an end goal would be useful. Maybe as an interim step?

[#critlib](#)


 2 YEARS AGO



**Caligula von Bingen**

@marxalot

Now, see that's what we need to have! Ditch the view of LC as the \*only\* source [#critlib](#)  
[twitter.com/kinderone1/sta...](https://twitter.com/kinderone1/status/1111111111)

 2 YEARS AGO



**Violet Fox**

@violetbfox

[@marccold](#) Do you think [#critlib](#) might be a place to do that? I'm imagining a virtual clearinghouse of change efforts...

 2 YEARS AGO



**Brett D. Currier**

brettdcurrier@brettdcurrier

Just because LCSH is the best system we have today does not make it the theoretical best system in the universe [#critlib](#)

 2 YEARS AGO



**Caligula von Bingen**

@marxalot

LC doesn't necessarily need our support: use it when it's useful, let it catch up when it isn't.

[#critlib](#) [twitter.com/kshockey04/sta...](https://twitter.com/kshockey04/status/1111111111)

 2 YEARS AGO



**Barnard Library**

barnlib @barnlib

A2 Not sure adding \*more\* ppl to decision-making process is the answer. Maybe diversifying SACO & consulting communities affected. [#critlib](#)

 2 YEARS AGO



**Laurel Narizny**  
@ekelistic

There are already so many other vocabs out there! LCSH isn't the end-all, be-all. #critlib  
[twitter.com/marxalot/statu...](https://twitter.com/marxalot/status...)

 2 YEARS AGO



**Nora Almeida**  
nora\_almeida @nora\_almeida

@adammizelle @kevinseeber yes, labor of human catalogers may be important component of IL instruction #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO



**Derrick**  
@geekandahalf

I would love to hear from @erinaleach re: LCSH in particular on this since I respect her expertise and POV. #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO



**Anna Neatrou**  
@annaneat

As an aside #critlib the ALCTS Metadata Interest Group will soon be releasing a CFP for ALA Annual on Diverse + Inclusive Metadata...

 2 YEARS AGO



**Netanel Ganin**  
OpOnions @OpOnions

"We're more inclined to react favorably to constructive suggestions than to coercive techniques such as petitions, hostile articles #CritLib

 2 YEARS AGO



**Barnard Library**  
barnlib @barnlib

A2: following LT: like how SACO made this 100% wrong decision w/o consulting people who catalog fanzines. #critlib [lowereastsidelibrarian.info/lcsh/2009/week...](http://lowereastsidelibrarian.info/lcsh/2009/week...)

 2 YEARS AGO



**Caligula von Bingen**

@marxalot

Lots of places have "in house" manuals etc for specialty collections. Some way of sharing those?  
[#critlib](#) [twitter.com/brettdcurrier/...](https://twitter.com/brettdcurrier/)

2 YEARS AGO

**Jennifer**

@gonessquirrelly

A2. Maybe from hierarchical to this, though not read yet: [researchgate.net/publication/26...](https://researchgate.net/publication/26...)  
[#critlib](#)

2 YEARS AGO



**Violet Fox**

@violetbfox

[@marccold](#) I was thinking a separate wiki section on [#critlib](#) website, actually... \*she says, already ridiculously overextended\*

2 YEARS AGO



**Anna Neatrou**

@annaneat

Please keep the CFP for Diverse + Inclusive Metadata in mind if you have further thoughts on [#critlib](#) discussion today and wish to present!

2 YEARS AGO



**Anna Neatrou**

@annaneat

We'll be posting to lists, sending out CFP very soon! [#critlib](#)

2 YEARS AGO



**Jaime, a librarian**

rowmyboat rowmyboat

.[@barnlib](#) Maybe more like different decision making \*structure\* and more people doing the \*work\*? [#critlib](#)

2 YEARS AGO



**Coral Sheldon-Hess**

web\_librarian

I feel like ILSs should allow us to make local terminology that hotlinks into the formal LCSH terms. #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Megan Browndorf**

@LiberryCobbler

Yes. This is work, living people are making these things findable, not by magic! #critlib  
[twitter.com/nora\\_almeida/s...](https://twitter.com/nora_almeida/s...)



2 YEARS AGO



**Nimisha Bhat**

mishiebhat

A2. This is what I struggle with. We all have our frustrations with the current system, but what do we do differently? #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Caligula von Bingen**

@marxalot

@barnlib Also: this is 2 issues; SH/access terms for discovery etc \*now\*, and LCSH reform processes for the \*long term\* #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Adam Mizelle**

adammmizelle

@nora\_almeida @kevinseeber Patrons are fuzzy about my work already. Lib inst to shout-out the hidden library workers. #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Shana L. McDanold**

@slmcdanold

#critlib It's important to remember that LCSH is only ONE set of controlled vocabulary. It's limited. "Literary warrant" is hard to show.



2 YEARS AGO



**Barnard Library**

barnlib @barnlib

A2 (?): Back to relevance rankings discussion, systems librarians really have no say?!?

[#SmashProprietaryLibrarySoftware](#) [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Shana L. McDanold**

@slmcdanold

[#critlib](#) Apply/use other controlled vocabularies liberally. And by "controlled" I mean has an identifier for [#linkeddata](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**chiuchiutrain**

chiuchiutrain

[@marxalot](#) [@barnlib](#) Do they have to be separate things? Isn't the frustration that the 2 aren't dealt with as 1 issue? [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Caligula von Bingen**

@marxalot

Also very specific to its holdings, which don't have everything (gasp!) and are tailored to its purpose [#critlib](#) [twitter.com/slmcdanold/sta...](https://twitter.com/slmcdanold/status/1234567890)



2 YEARS AGO

**Jennifer**

@gonessquirrelly

Why was LCSH created in the first place? Do we still need it for that? Have we moved beyond it?

[#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Coral Sheldon-Hess**

web\_librarian

[@ibeilin](#) [@gonessquirrelly](#) [@marccold](#) I was taught "It's better than Dewey." I think we can all agree: true for many (most?) subjects. [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



Wendy Robertson

wendycr @wendycr\_

@gonessquirrelly Wasn't it created by Library of Congress for their collection needs, for the Congress? Not created for our needs #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



Wendy Robertson

wendycr @wendycr\_

@gonessquirrelly And created around limitations of a card catalog #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



Charlotte E. Price

PoorCharlotte Charlotte

@barnlib re: relevance rankings, I wonder how a homegrown system like the one UPenn is using works with that... #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



Allana Meilleur

allanaaaa @allanaaaaaaa

I've been in multiple conference Q&As where an LC cataloguer has announced that they appreciate feedback and want to make changes #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



Netanel Ganin

OpOnions @OpOnions

Literary warrant (B.T. men. ) can be a crock, I've found #LCSH with a \*single\* usage in the LC catalog - but they approved THAT one #CritLib



2 YEARS AGO



Barnard Library

barnlib @barnlib

Following up on @em\_harlow's comment on #LOD. It may be time to build smaller/distinct authority files (aka mutual metadata). #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Stacie Traill**  
@straiakat

@barnlib Some control but limited: not at the level of seeing the algorithm as a whole/ability to tinker with very specific stuff #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO



**Violet Fox**  
@violetbfox

@barnlib In my experience it's been impossible to talk with vendors and get straight answers about relevancy rankings. #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO



**Jaime, a librarian**  
rowmyboat@rowmyboat

I totally don't care which vocab(s) our catalogers use as long it's 1. correct (MARC indicators/subfields, say) & 2. consistent. #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO



**Caligula von Bingen**  
@marxalot

@chiuchiutrain @barnlib LCSH isn't the only authority source, and oughtn't be. One is institutional, the other existential #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO



**MARCinaColdClimate**  
marccold@marccold

A2. Can't help wondering whether our ideas of "literary warrant" need to change, esp if we are to catalog diff types of resources. #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO



**Caligula von Bingen**  
@marxalot

THIS. PT/RT/BT/NT algorithms DO THIS already. Modifying will take time & money but is so worth it! #critlib [twitter.com/web\\_librarian/...](https://twitter.com/web_librarian/)

 2 YEARS AGO

**Q3. Should we be localizing efforts at our individual institutions to create a more inclusive SH system? Or is a nation-wide system the only way to go?**





**Nimisha Bhat**

mishiebhat  
@mishiebhat

Q3. Should we be localizing efforts at our institutions to create a more inclusive SH system?  
Local thesauruses? [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**J. Turner Masland**

deweysnotdead  
@deweysnotdead

[#critlib](#) Q3 I would argue that this work could also be done among consortia. Maybe more power to enact change is we work together?



2 YEARS AGO



**Shana L. McDanold**

@slmcdanold

A3: local vocabularies keep our resources in our silos. We should focus on building/contributing to existing [#linkeddata](#) vocabs [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Kevin Seeber**

@kevinseeber

A3- As far as reforming national system of subject headings, perhaps [#JebCanFixIt?](#) [#critlib](#)  
[#humor](#) [#topicalhumor](#) [#politicalhumor](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Caligula von Bingen**

@marxalot

[@violethfox](#) [@barnlib](#) get the impression it's either handwavey or they don't want you to know or both? [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Danielle Jacobs**

@DanjelleJ

Why not have an open tagging system where patrons come up with alt. SH while catalogers use LCSH SH? [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Stacie Traill**  
@straiikat

@FromtheShelves @slmcdanold Also there are loads of proprietary controlled vocabs used by indexing and content providers. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO



**MARCinaColdClimate**  
marccold@marccold

@ibeilin @gonesquirrelly Will voice the minority view here and say that controlled vocabularies are extraordinarily important now. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO



**Christina Harlow**  
cm\_harlow@cm\_harlow

. @barnlib yeah some folks are already doing this, and building relationships btwn LOD authorities/data gives you lots of power. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO

**Jennifer**  
@gonesquirrelly

@web\_librarian reflective of world where newer people expect full text thus to them "crippled" #critlib

2 YEARS AGO



**Stacie Traill**  
@straiikat

@FromtheShelves @slmcdanold They can be less open to influence of non-privileged communities than LCSH, if not as widely used. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO



**Shana L. McDanold**  
@slmcdanold

YES. Controlled vocab = IDENTIFIER in #semanticweb which builds #linkeddata and increased discoverability #critlib [twitter.com/marccold/statu...](https://twitter.com/marccold/status...)

2 YEARS AGO

 **Jennifer**  
@gonessquirrelly


@web\_librarian @ibeilin @marccold problem with agreement as "one size doesn't fit all"  
#critlib

 2 YEARS AGO


 **Karl Ericson**  
kinderone1

@deweysnotdead would think many institutions would need to share the work load as catalogers and systems ppl workload already maxed #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO


 **Jaime, a librarian**  
rowmyboat


A3 We totally should! As long as we do it correctly (MARC indicators & subfields, say) & consistently! #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO


 **Stevie Feliciano**  
StevieFeliciano


A3 Localizing efforts is one solution that I am for but shouldn't we look at the larger problem at hand? #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO


 **J. Turner Masland**  
deweysnotdead

#critlib Q3 also, I wonder if more opportunity for change is created as cataloging activities become more collaborative

 2 YEARS AGO

 **Adam Mizelle**  
adammmizelle

@kevinseeber Only if the results are close. #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO



**Jaime, a librarian**

rowmyboat

A3 I'm also totally down with tags, natural language, user added, or otherwise--but as distinct from SH, because they're different. #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Coral Sheldon-Hess**

web\_librarian

A3 I do NOT think we should localize subject headings unless there's some way to link them together intelligently. #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**J. Turner Masland**

deweysnotdead

@kinderone I know orbis cascade is exploring collaborative cataloging work loads, to share the burden #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Charlotte E. Price**

PoorCharlotte

A3 I feel conflicted. I want more user participation, but I want consistency that a folksonomy can't really bring. I want it all! #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Shana L. McDanold**

@slmcdanold

A3 Ontologies and vocabularies are what we need to build, OUTSIDE of library catalogs #critlib [w3.org/standards/sema...](http://w3.org/standards/sema...)



2 YEARS AGO



**Caligula von Bingen**

@marxalot

Consistency is key. We're in the business of making things findable: that means predictable/learnable #critlib [twitter.com/rowmyboat/stat...](https://twitter.com/rowmyboat/stat...)



2 YEARS AGO



**DPWaybrarian**

@DPWayman


A3-Discovery layers often offer the ability to "tag" items; if searchable in the same interface, that functionality is provided. [#critlib](#)

 2 YEARS AGO

**Jennifer**

@gonesquirrelly

Q? Isn't changing LCSH rewriting history to suit current perceptions? [#critlib](#) How is that different from past applications of subj headings


 2 YEARS AGO



**Ian Beilin**

@ibeilin

[@gonesquirrelly](#) it's not rewriting history, but retiring it [#critlib](#)

 2 YEARS AGO

**Jennifer**

@gonesquirrelly

[@ibeilin](#) Not even when LCSH goes and retroactively changes old headings to new ones? [#critlib](#)

 2 YEARS AGO



**Wendy Robertson**

wendycr@wendycr\_

[@gonesquirrelly](#) Yes. Their view of what is important both for what is cataloged and what to call it [#critlib](#)

 2 YEARS AGO



**Nimisha Bhat**

mishiebhat@mishiebhat

[@gonesquirrelly](#) [@rowmyboat](#) More like seeing what worked/didn't, creating a new open consortium system of implementation/change? [#critlib](#)

 2 YEARS AGO



**Emily Drabinski**

@edrabinski

[@gonesquirrelly](#) I always wonder what history will reveal as my most appalling ideological commitment. [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Jamie Howe**

Gaymerbrarian

[@marxalot](#) [@ibeilin](#) [@gonesquirrelly](#) it's an artifact if we like it or not. We should support documentation of outmoded use at least [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Wendy Robertson**

wendycr\_

[@gonesquirrelly](#) Do you mean we should continue to use terms appropriate for the era of publication, not terms in use today? [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO

**Jennifer**

@gonesquirrelly

[@wendycr\\_](#) Both. History is important and should understand where we have been re:construction of knowledge/identity/acceptance [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Caligula von Bingen**

@marxalot

[@ibeilin](#) [@gonesquirrelly](#) The purpose of the LCSH isn't historical: it's use. It's a tool, not an artifact (or should be) [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Danielle Jacobs**

@DanjelleJ

[@Gaymerbrarian](#) [@marxalot](#) [@ibeilin](#) [@gonesquirrelly](#) it would be documented in the material but no need for outdated SH? [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Coral Sheldon-Hess**

web\_librarian

@wendycr\_ @gonesquirrelly I feel like we'd need both, right? If I were doing historical research, I'd search period terms. #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Caligula von Bingen**

@marxalot

Sure, as "deprecated terms," but not at the expense of keeping it relevant. #critlib  
[twitter.com/Gaymerbrarian/...](https://twitter.com/Gaymerbrarian/)



2 YEARS AGO

**Jennifer**

@gonesquirrelly

@marxalot @ibeilin It is both because it speaks to the politics of knowledge #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Ian Beilin**

@ibeilin

@gonesquirrelly If the point is current use, why would they want to keep the outmoded SH in place? #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Shana L. McDanold**

@slmcdanold

@FromtheShelves @kevinseeber LCSH was designed for congress & items being kept in LC b/c of copyright. It's inherently biased. #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Melissa A**

@MelissaA1763

@ekelistic Unfortunately paywalled, this article has more info: [tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.10...](https://tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.10...)  
A # of Indigenous libraries use Brian Deer #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Kevin Seeber**  
@kevinseeber

@FromtheShelves Totally. I'm more on the side of reforming academic discourse, then the SH will follow. #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO



**John Mark Ockerbloom**  
@JMarkOckerbloom

A lot of LCSH discussion focuses on the headings, but the relationships are also important, & IME often underdeveloped. #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO



**Shana L. McDanold**  
@slmcdanold

#critlib previous #LCSH terms are kept in the record as "see" references. This can be maintained in #linkeddata environment

 2 YEARS AGO



**Coral Sheldon-Hess**

web\_librarian  
web\_librarian

A3 And I know that won't fix it all. We have some systemic problems to fix (e.g. "Black history" search brings up white violence). #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO



**MARCinaColdClimate**

marccold  
marccold

OT, but it seems convos often focus on #LCSH, rather than #LCC. Prob b/c class schemes change VERY SLOWLY indeed, for obv reasons. #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO



**Nora Almeida**

nora\_almeida  
nora\_almeida

@slmcdanold Yes! concern should be how to maximize labor, enhance discoverability, & diversify vocabs. #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO





**Melissa A**  
@MelissaA1763

Late to #critlib party. I'm at a small institutional lib. that doesn't actually use LC (b/c inaccurate terminology; bias; specialized coll.)

2 YEARS AGO



**Laurel Narizny**  
@ekelistic

@MelissaA1763 Your institution actually made the decision to not use LCSH? Would love to hear more. Do you guys coop. catalog? #critlib

2 YEARS AGO



**Melissa A**  
@MelissaA1763

We use modified Brian Deer. Have (some) mapping to help with cataloguing. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO



**Jaime, a librarian**  
rowmyboat  
rowmyboat

Bc it's never-ending process. Go ahead & change it again in the future. #critlib  
[twitter.com/gonesquirrelly...](https://twitter.com/gonesquirrelly...)

2 YEARS AGO



**Caligula von Bingen**  
@marxalot

Allowing tag suggestions, mediated by backend vocab control/linking, WORKS, but means \$\$\$.  
#critlib [twitter.com/PoorCharlotte/...](https://twitter.com/PoorCharlotte/)

2 YEARS AGO



**MARCinaColdClimate**  
marccold  
marccold

@gonesquirrelly @ibeilin Take LGBT\*. How many poss keywords are there? Will any user search every single one? Collocation is key. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO



**Joel Burkholder**  
@FromtheShelves


Controlled vocabs privilege acad discourse, not natural lang. Is there a system we could create that doesn't recog this hierarchy? [#critlib](#)

 2 YEARS AGO



**chiuchiutrain**  
chiuchiutrain

[@FromtheShelves](#) Is there a solution to that? I feel that acad catalogs shouldn't be divorced from pub catalogs. [#smashtheivorytower](#) [#critlib](#)

 2 YEARS AGO



**Violet Fox**  
@violetbfox

[@FromtheShelves](#) I think yes, but complexity would be sacrificed. Not necessarily a bad thing, especially when used in combinations. [#critlib](#)

 2 YEARS AGO



**Danielle Jacobs**  
@DanjelleJ

[@OpOnions](#) I heard a museum in texas or somewhere was using tagging systems to tag their art and even let patrons vote on "best" art. [#critlib](#)

 2 YEARS AGO



**Charlotte E. Price**  
PoorCharlotte

[@shatomica](#) using alt. fields works great but then we found that WorldCat discovery didn't display many of them anymore.... [#critlib](#)

 2 YEARS AGO



**Kevin Seeber**  
@kevinseeber

[@FromtheShelves](#) But if LCSH is primarily used for acad collections, shouldn't SH reflect that language? [#critlib](#)

 2 YEARS AGO



**Charlotte E. Price**

PoorCharlotte  
@PoorCharlotte

A3 I really wish we had something Open Access but with library control, but then you have the same problems of biases etc [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Shana L. McDanold**

@slmcdanold

[#critlib](#) Tagging and Controlled vocabs (LCSH, genres, others) are NOT mutually exclusive. You can use both. But they are fundamentally diff.



2 YEARS AGO



**Jonathan Cope**

stupidlover  
@stupidlover

A3 Do people think that the concept of universal bibliographic control is inherently authoritarian? [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO

**Patricia Gimenez**

@TriciaGimenez

@DanjelleJ @OpOnions ooo image metadata is a whole other issue [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Caligula von Bingen**

@marxalot

Not just maintained, but expanded. LOD is \*great\* for synonym/relationship circles [#critlib](#)  
[twitter.com/slmcdanold/sta...](https://twitter.com/slmcdanold/status/1234567890)



2 YEARS AGO



**Danielle Jacobs**

@DanjelleJ

I think using terms appropriate to the era of the material is bull because patrons might not even know old SH Its irrelevant [#critlib](#)




2 YEARS AGO



**Shana L. McDanold**  
@slmcdanold

TAGS = personal use, not "neutral analysis" of the "aboutness" of an item. Can be misleading. [#critlib](#) Hence why you use BOTH.

 2 YEARS AGO



**Coral Sheldon-Hess**  
web\_librarian

[@slmcdanold](#) Yeah, you should see some of the tags I use in GoodReads. Not exactly helpful to people-who-aren't-me. :) [#critlib](#)

 2 YEARS AGO



**Shana L. McDanold**  
@slmcdanold

Tis true. We don't have control, only [#semanticweb](#) [#linkeddata](#) identifiers. :) [#critlib](#)  
[twitter.com/edrabinski/sta...](https://twitter.com/edrabinski/status/1000000000000000000)

 2 YEARS AGO



**Joel Burkholder**  
@FromtheShelves

[@kevinseeber](#) Don't think LCSH treat all discourses equally. Makes judgment calls. [#critlib](#)

 2 YEARS AGO



**Nora Almeida**  
nora\_almeida

[@slmcdanold](#) Agreed! I don't think an either / or approach works. Local reinvention still has problem of top-down desc. [#critlib](#)

 2 YEARS AGO



**Emily Drabinski**  
@edrabinski

I love our field's persistent fantasies of total control. It's all very [#50shades](#) [#critlib](#)  
[twitter.com/stupidplover/s...](https://twitter.com/stupidplover/status/1000000000000000000)

 2 YEARS AGO



**Jaime, a librarian**

rowmyboat

Just wanna throw it out there -- the [#systems](#) most of use are totally insufficient to support some of the changes we'd like to see. [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Jaime, a librarian**

rowmyboat

...and we have even less control over most of our systems that we do over LCSH & most other vocabs. [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Wendy Robertson**

wendycr

[@OpOnions](#) [@gonessquirrelly](#) Yes, geographic headings have that issue. But I think other terms can/should modernize [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Wendy Robertson**

wendycr

[@gonessquirrelly](#) I think this can be noted effectively as a cross reference in a linked authority record, but not stay on ind record [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO

**Jennifer**

[@gonessquirrelly](#)

[@OpOnions](#) [@wendycr](#) True. An equally political decision about recognition and refusal of independent authority of countries. [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Nimisha Bhat**

mishiebhat

[@ibeilin](#) [@gonessquirrelly](#) The archivist in me thinks it's important to keep a record of the changes, but not keep the outmoded SH [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Adam Mizelle**

adammi@adammizelle

[@mishiebhat](#) [@ibeilin](#) [@gonessquirrelly](#) I agree. Amnesia is a big obstacle to reckoning with racism and other problems. [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Danielle Jacobs**

@DanjelleJ

I dont understand why we need to keep outdated/racist/sexist/ just messed up overall SH for history keeping? why bother? [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Ian Beilin**

@ibeilin

[@web\\_librarian](#) yes, they shouldn't be erased from the historical record, only from the catalog record [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**John Mark Ockerbloom**

@JMarkOckerbloom

2006 OA paper on indigenous classification schemes: "From Marginalization to Accessibility": [commons.pacificu.edu/cgi/viewconten...](https://commons.pacificu.edu/cgi/viewcontent...) [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Coral Sheldon-Hess**

web\_lib@web\_librarian

[@ibeilin](#) I'm suggesting historical terms should be in the record for findability, but NOT that they should be the primary access pt [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Wendy Robertson**

wendycr@wendycr\_

[@web\\_librarian](#) [@gonessquirrelly](#) For a full text search, sure. But subject, I would think date of publication + current term [#critlib](#)




2 YEARS AGO

**Jennifer**

@gonesquirrelly

[@ibeilin](#) LCSH continues as placeholders or markers for larger concepts; or morph to become reflective of scholarly conversations? [#critlib](#)


 2 YEARS AGO



**Wendy Robertson**

wendycr@wendycr\_

[@web\\_librarian](#) [@gonesquirrelly](#) You would search war between the states for a book about the Civil War written in the 19th century? [#critlib](#)

 2 YEARS AGO

**Patricia Gimenez**

@TriciaGimenez

[@wendycr\\_](#) [@web\\_librarian](#) [@gonesquirrelly](#) don't y'all mean the war of northern aggression? (joke from a temp southerner) [#critlib](#)

 2 YEARS AGO



**Caligula von Bingen**

@marxalot

[@DanjelleJ](#) I wouldn't keep it in the active SH, but include those terms to show how things were described. No amnesia. [#critlib](#)

 2 YEARS AGO



**Coral Sheldon-Hess**

web\_librarian@web\_librarian

[@chiuchiutrain](#) [@FromtheShelves](#) And, in many locales (like southcentral Alaska), public & academic catalogs aren't separate at all. [#critlib](#)

 2 YEARS AGO

**Jennifer**

@gonesquirrelly

[@wendycr\\_](#) [@OpOnions](#) Modernize ok but don't throw out the old as is part of our tapestry of understanding [#critlib](#)

 2 YEARS AGO



**MARCinaColdClimate**

marccold@marccold

@ibeilin @web\_librarian There needs to be collocation. We don't have that now for countries that have changed names, and it's tough #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Jonathan Cope**

stupidplover@stupidplover

@nora\_almeida Could UBC be a benign authoritarianism? Should the concept be abandoned? #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Shana L. McDanold**

@slmcdanold

#critlib We should be building connections \*between\* vocabularies (same as, ~ to) etc. Not "reinventing" them. #linkeddata #SemanticWeb



2 YEARS AGO



**Karl Ericson**

kinderone@kinderone1

@rowmyboat question becomes how do we agitate for change from vendors who are slow to move? #critlib



2 YEARS AGO



**Jaime, a librarian**

rowmyboat@rowmyboat

Damned if I know. Now, tossing some of THAT in the bin & starting over -- I'm into that. #critlib  
[twitter.com/kinderone1/sta...](https://twitter.com/kinderone1/status/1111111111)



2 YEARS AGO



**Melissa A**

@MelissaA1763

@ekelistic We do do copy cataloguing but adjust; have LCC maps, look at other lib's doing similar; but also a learning curve for me #critlib



2 YEARS AGO





**Violet Fox**  
@violetbfox

@TriciaGimenez @wendycr\_ @web\_librarian @gonesquirrelly Ha. No, but there are plenty of terms that aren't easy 1=1 relationships. #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO



**Coral Sheldon-Hess**  
web\_librarian

@violetbfox @TriciaGimenez @wendycr\_ @gonesquirrelly True. Some metadata doesn't link cleanly. #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO



**John Mark Ockerbloom**  
@JMarkOckerbloom

@wendycr\_ IMO, some dated terms could describe notable eras for a topic, but they should either be aliases or NTs to current ones. #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO



**John Mark Ockerbloom**  
@JMarkOckerbloom

(eg. "Information superhighway" captures 1990s what-will-the-Net be discussion, but shouldn't be so high in current LCSH hierarchy) #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO



**Caligula von Bingen**  
@marxalot

Don't disagree: SH should be a living object, but I don't mean to erase past terms, just deprecate #critlib [twitter.com/gonesquirrelly...](https://twitter.com/gonesquirrelly)

 2 YEARS AGO

liberation in information literacy can free one from hegemony.[11] I propose a more modest goal: historicize the catalog. Instead of abandoning or overthrowing it, realize and then teach that catalogs and systems of classification are not only social constructs, created by humans, but also historical constructs, created at specific points in time. Recast in historicist light, Berman's work on LCSHs appears more radical as he and others worked to revise and dismantle subject headings that reflected a white male power structure while many did the same with regards to society at large. In short, by asking the LC to add, amend, or eliminate some subject headings, Berman is historicizing the catalog. I suggest that creation dates of LCSHs be added to LCSH authority records so patrons can see when headings were created. Others, like dates of major reorganizations, should be entered as well. Doing so will make it easier for users to view catalogs as products of their times.

A3 for #critlib: (Also, hi, I'm Jake in Washington, DC.) [pic.twitter.com/hTY2xwKnGh](https://pic.twitter.com/hTY2xwKnGh)


 JACOB BERG @JACOBSBERG · 2 YEARS AGO



**Jessica Colbert**

Jessica Colbert @JColbert

Should database subjects be the same as LCSH? It's always hard giving instruction without consistency! #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO



**Melissa A**

@MelissaA1763

@ekelistic (should add that doing LCSH from scratch would also be a learning curve - Brian Deer actually makes more sense to me) #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO



**Melissa A**

@MelissaA1763

@ekelistic (and Deer makes waaayyy more sense for our library patrons) #critlib

 2 YEARS AGO



**Joel Burkholder**  
@FromtheShelves

@chiuchiutrain Don't know. Guess my point: Impossible to change the language of acad disciplines. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO



**Tina**  
aboutness

#critlib Here you can find (halfway down page) LC's response to the proposal to change "Illegal aliens" [loc.gov/aba/pcc/saco/c...](http://loc.gov/aba/pcc/saco/c...)

2 YEARS AGO

#### Q4. How can we draw non-catalogers into the fold to help create change?



**Nimisha Bhat**  
mishiebhat

I could continue this for hours if I could! But time for Q4: How can we draw non-catalogers into the fold to help create change? #critlib

2 YEARS AGO



**Jessica Colbert**  
JColbert

A4: I think getting reference librarians' suggestions on what sort of search terms are used/etc. would be helpful #critlib

2 YEARS AGO



**Jessica Colbert**  
JColbert

A4: but I generally think reference and cataloging should influence each other more #critlib

2 YEARS AGO



**Jessica Colbert**  
JColbert

A4: no type of librarian works in a vacuum. No librarian is an island. #critlib

2 YEARS AGO



**Adam Mizelle**

adammi@delammizelle

A4: Like in all organizing. Identify the support and give them a specific ask for a specific task.  
[#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Stevie Feliciano**

StevieFeliciano

A4: Explain to non cataloging professionals the importance of this issue and getting input from librarians in the field [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Jaime, a librarian**

rowmyboat

I often ask our ref staff if changes I'm considering to display.search make sense for them & patrons. [#critlib](#) [twitter.com/JessicaLColber...](https://twitter.com/JessicaLColber...)



2 YEARS AGO



**Kevin Seeber**

@kevinseeber

A4- We have a good number of non-catalogers in this chat! I'll leave it to catalogers to direct this, but remember you have allies. [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Charlotte E. Price**

PoorCharlotte

A4: I mostly wish there was an easier/more transparent way to edit these headings, & for non-catalogers to know they can, too [#critlib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**Netanel Ganin**

OpOnions

Totally forgot talk about A4 -- I would want to hear from the communities for their terms  
[#CritLib](#)



2 YEARS AGO



**DPWaybrarian**

@DPWayman

A4-Change is inherent; change for better, what's "better"? Distrust authority & control? Why accept it from non-cataloger experts? [#critlib](#)


 2 YEARS AGO



**Rory Litwin**

rorylitwin@rorylitwin

Best [#critlib](#) to date, imho....

 2 YEARS AGO



**Violet Fox**

@violefbfox

[#critlib](#) pitch: keep using [#critcat](#) for critical cataloging and classification issues! [#critcats](#) with an "s" is for your critlib cat pics.


 2 YEARS AGO



**Coral Sheldon-Hess**

web\_lib@web\_librarian

My librarian heart is SO WARM! People are getting FEISTY about metadata! [#critlib](#)

 2 YEARS AGO



**shatomica**

shatomica@shatomica

@[JessicaLColbert](#) and definitely starts with building good relationships across depts. territorial behavior is a huge obstacle! [#critlib](#)

 2 YEARS AGO



**Nimisha Bhat**

mishiebh@mishiebhat

Y'all, this was a great chat and I feel like we BARELY skimmed the surface! Can't wait for more discussions to follow [#critlib](#)

 2 YEARS AGO